



## potatoMETAbiome

Harnessing the potato-microbiome interactions for development of sustainable breeding and production strategies









#### Impressum

Projektnehmer:in: Univ.-Prof. Dipl.-Biol. Dr.rer.nat. Gabriele Berg

Department für Umweltbiotechnologie, Technische Universität Graz

Adresse: Petersgasse 12, A-8010 Graz, AUSTRIA

Projektleiter:in: Gabriele Berg

Tel.: +43 (0) 316 873 8310

E-Mail: gabriele.berg@tugraz.at

Kooperationspartner:in:

University of Groningen, Groningen Institute for Evolutionary Life Sciences;

Technische Universität München, Wissenschaftszentrum Weihenstephan Chair for Soil Science;

University of Limerick, Biological Sciences;

Université de Pau et des Pays de l'Adour, IPREM, UMR 5254 CNRS/UPPA;

Warsaw University of Life Sciences – SGGW, Faculty of Economic Sciences;

Institute of Agrophysics, Polish Academy of Sciences, Department of Soil and Plant System;

Plant Breeding and Acclimatization Institute -National Research Institute, Bonin Research Center;

Max-Planck-Gesellschaft zur Förderung der Wissenschaften e.V., Max-Planck-Institute of Molecular Plant Physiology, Potsdam

Finanzierungsstelle(n):

BML (AT);

ANR (FR);

BMBF/JUELICH and DFG (DE);

NWO (NL);

DAFM (IE);

NCBR (PL);

Projektlaufzeit: 36 Monate

92. Auflage

ISBN: 101392

Fotonachweis: Cover: unplash.com/Ferdinand Stöhr, ...



PEFC recycelt Dieses Produkt stammt Recycling und kontrollierten Quellen, 304/27 www.pefc.at

Graz, 2022. Stand: 22. März 2023

#### Inhalt

Vorwort4
1a. Description of the project5
1b. Projektbeschreibung5
2. Introduction92.1 Scientific overview of the project9
2.2 Work Package 4 (biotic stress) – Strategies to improve potato resilience to biotic stress
– Lead: Institute of Environmental Biotechnology (TU Graz)11
3 Results
3.1 Deliverables
3.2 Procedure for constructing the 4 four-strain bacterial consortia
3.2.1 Microorganisms selected for the project13
3.2.2 Screening of isolates14
3.2.3 Screening of consortia16
3.2.4 Screening of consortia including a booster substance
3.2.5 Narrowing the formulation by performing greenhouse trials
3.2.6 Assessment of the formulations in greenhouse trials
3.2.7 Selection of the formulation with the most suppressive effect against R. solani in
the field
3.2.8 Evaluation of formulation efficiency with different potato genotypes
3.2.9 Targeted screening for boosters for the beneficial consortium 'Patricia'
3.2.10 Effect of the beneficial consortium 'Patricia' containing 2-methyl-1-butanol on
the plant's life cycle
3.2.11 Effect of the beneficial consortium 'Patricia' containing 2-methyl-1-butanol on
different potato genotypes65
3.2.12 Effect of 2-methyl-1-butanol on the production of volatiles on the beneficial
consortium 'Patricia'72
Tabellenverzeichnis74
Abbildungsverzeichnis
Literaturverzeichnis
Abkürzungen83

## Vorwort



Gabriele Berg Institute of Environmental Biotechnology, Graz

Nachhaltige Entwicklungen im Bereich der Landwirtschaft gewinnen zunehmend an Bedeutung. Sie werden in Zukunft viele konventionelle Prozesse, vor allem im Zusammenhang mit dem Anbau von Nutzpflanzen, ersetzen müssen, um die Weltbevölkerung ernähren zu können ohne weiter unsere Umwelt und das Klima negativ zu beeinflussen. Das natürliche Pflanzenmikrobiom bietet die bisher vielversprechendste Basis, um solche Entwicklungen voranzutreiben. Im internationalen sowie interdisziplinären Projekt potatoMETAbiome versuchen wir zum ersten Mal gezielt Wechselwirkungen zwischen unterschiedlichen Kartoffelkultivaren und ihrem spezifischen Mikrobiom zu entschlüsseln, um sie für zukünftige Anwendungen in der Landwirtschaft bereitzustellen.

Prof. Gabriele Berg hat Biologie, Ökologie und Biotechnologie in Rostock und Greifswald studiert und ihr Doktorat 1995 an der Universität Rostock abgeschlossen. Sie erhielt 2003 ein Heisenberg-Stipendium der DFG und 2005 eine Universitätsprofessur an der Technischen Universität Graz wo sie seither am Institut für Umweltbiotechnologie lehrt und forscht. Das unabhängige Analyseinstitut Clarivate Analytics hat sie in den Jahren 2018 sowie 2019 als eine der einflussreichsten Wissenschaftlerinnen im weltweiten Ranking gelistet.

## 1a. Description of the project

Results obtained within the PotatoMETAbiome project contribute to the development of sustainable forms of potato cultivation, currently largely based on high inputs of fertilizers, pesticides, and water, by exploiting the functions of the soil microbiome and enhanced interactions between plants and microbes. In order to achieve sustainable potato cultivation, it is necessary to consider plants as meta-organism: holobionts with its associated microbiome. In the project, important microbial strains were examined, which have a positive effect on the resilience of potato plants to biotic stress. Laboratory experiments were verified in field tests to verify their applicability under real conditions. The evaluation of socio-economic and environmental impacts of the developed strategies was conducted, including potato genotypes selected for their optimal interactions between plants and the microbiome, as well as involving stakeholders during the project further ensure the dissemination and implementation of the strategies. In particular, the development of plants with optimal soil utilization (improved root biomass) and microbiome acquisition will reduce the impact of abiotic stresses such as drought, as well as biotic stresses from pathogens. Additionally, these traits can improve the plant's resource use efficiency through interactions with beneficial microbes. This increase in potato resilience can lead to a reduction in fertilizer and pesticide use, thereby reducing the ecological footprint of potato farmers. For this purpose, selected bacteria were tested as part of this project for their antagonistic effects against the potato pathogen Rhizoctonia solani and, together with a booster substance, two consortia were established, which were then tested in the field. The treated plants had significantly fewer disease symptoms and a higher yield of marketable potato tubers. Using modern highthroughput sequencing techniques, changes in the microbiome were identified in microbial communities, including bacteria, fungi and oomycetes. Especially the treatment with the consortium, but also the presence of *R. solani*, can explain part of the microbiome composition. In a follow-up experiment, changes in the microbiome and plant parameters over the life cycle of potato plants stressed with *R. solani*, which were treated either with the consortium "Patricia" or with water, were investigated. The treated plants showed increased stress resilience, plant growth and had larger tubers with fewer disease symptoms. The microbial diversity increased over the course of the life cycle and tended to be higher in treated plants. Overall, we were able to show within the scope of this project, both under controlled conditions and in the open field, that the targeted

treatment of stressed potato plants with the constructed consortia can represent a sustainable and ecological alternative to the methods used up to now.

## 1b. Projektbeschreibung

Die Ergebnisse, die im Rahmen des PotatoMETAbiome-Projekts gewonnen wurden, tragen zur Entwicklung nachhaltiger Formen des Kartoffelanbaus bei, die derzeit weitgehend auf einem hohen Anteil an Düngemitteln, Pestiziden und Wasser beruhen, indem die Funktionen des Bodenmikrobioms und verbesserte Wechselwirkungen zwischen Pflanzen und Mikroben genutzt werden. Um einen nachhaltigen Kartoffelanbau zu ermöglichen, ist es notwendig Pflanzen als Meta-Organismen zu betrachten, die vielerlei Interaktionen mit ihrem Mikrobiom eingehen. Im Projekt wurden wichtige mikrobielle Stämme untersucht, welche sich positiv auf die Resilienz von den Kartoffelpflanzen, bei biotischem Stress, auswirken. Die aus Laborversuchen resultierenden Ergebnisse wurden in Feldversuchen bestätigt, um ihre Einsetzbarkeit unter realen Bedingungen zu verifizieren. Die Bewertung der sozioökonomischen und ökologischen Auswirkungen der entwickelten Strategien, einschließlich der Kartoffelgenotypen, die aufgrund ihrer optimalen Wechselwirkungen zwischen Pflanzen und des Mikrobioms ausgewählt wurden, und die Beteiligung der Interessengruppen während des Projekts konnten die Verbreitung und Umsetzung der Strategien weiters sicherstellen. Insbesondere die Entwicklung von Pflanzen mit optimaler Bodennutzung (verbesserte Wurzelbiomasse) und Mikrobiom-Akquirierung wird die Auswirkungen abiotischer Belastungen wie Trockenheit sowie biotischer Belastungen durch Krankheitserreger verringern. Zusätzlich können diese Eigenschaften die Ressourcennutzungseffizienz der Pflanze durch Wechselwirkungen mit nützlichen Mikroben verbessern. Diese Erhöhung der Widerstandsfähigkeit der Kartoffeln kann zu einem Rückgang des Einsatzes von Düngemitteln und Pestiziden führen, wodurch der ökologische Fußabdruck der Kartoffelproduktion verringert wird. Dafür wurden im Rahmen dieses Projekts ausgewählte Bakterien auf ihre antagonistischen Effekte gegen den Kartoffelpathogen Rhizoctonia solani getestet und gemeinsam mit einer Booster-Substanz wurden daraus zwei Konsortien erstellt, die danach im Feld getestet wurden. Die behandelten Pflanzen hatten signifikant weniger Krankheitssymptome und einen höheren Ertrag an marktfähigen Kartoffeln. Durch Einsatz von modernen Hochdurchsatzsequenzierungen wurden Veränderungen im Mikrobiom, sowohl bei Bakterien, Pilzen als auch Oomyceten, festgestellt. Vor allem die Behandlung mit dem Konsortium, aber auch das Vorkommen von R. solani, erklären einen Teil der Mikrobiom-Zusammensetzung. In einem Folgeexperiment wurden Veränderungen im Mikrobiom und Pflanzenparameter über den Lebenszyklus von, mit R. solani behandelten,

Kartoffelpflanzen untersucht, die entweder mit dem Konsortium "Patricia" oder mit

Wasser behandelt wurden. Die behandelten Pflanzen zeigten eine erhöhte Stressresilienz, verbessertes Pflanzenwachstum und hatten größere Knollen mit weniger Krankheitssymptomen. Die Diversität des Mikrobioms nahm im Laufe des Lebenszyklus zu, und war tendenziell höher bei den behandelten Pflanzen. Insgesamt konnten wir im Rahmen dieses Projekts, sowohl unter kontrollierten Bedingungen, als auch im freien Feld zeigen, dass die gezielte Behandlung von gestressten Kartoffelpflanzen, mit dem konstruierten Konsortien eine nachhaltige und ökologische Alternative zu den bisher angewandten Methoden darstellen kann.

## 2. Introduction

## 2.1 Scientific overview of the project

The European Union spends about 38% of its annual budget on agriculture, supporting an agricultural output worth over €400 Billion per year (Sgueo et al. 2016). Concerning potato production, 53 billion tons of raw potatoes were harvested in the EU in 2015 (Eurostat 2017). Additional to food production, a large number of potatoes harvested in Europe are used in industry for starch production. The majority (98.5%) of these potatoes stem from conventional potato growing.

Current agricultural practices are yet non-sustainable. Potato breeding strategies focus on high productivity, thus modern cultivars may have lost some of the traits needed to recruit host-specific beneficial root microbiota (Sawers et al., 2008) The majority of cultivars has been developed to sustain high yields in production systems with an increased need for external inputs such as chemical pesticides and fertilizers. This circumstance has negative impacts on soil biodiversity and contributes to environmental and food contamination (McCullough and Matson 2012).

Plants harbour a wide diversity of microorganisms that colonize the surface of the roots and the adhering soil that is enriched with specific root exudates (rhizosphere) or inner plant tissues (endophytes). Plants and their associated microbiomes form complex and dynamic mutualistic interactions (Mendes et al. 2011), and can be considered as a meta-organism the so called 'holobiont' (Vandenkoornhuyse et al. 2015). Native as well as crop plants provide ecological niches and easily utilizable carbon to their microbiome. The microbiome is seen as the plant's second genome (Turner et al. 2013), which provides complimentary plant-beneficial functions. It fulfils several substantial functions, particularly the rhizosphere and endophytes compartment, are known to suppress diseases (Mendes et al. 2011), to improve drought resistance, to alter aboveground herbivory (Hol et al. 2010) or even to modify flowering time, highlighting the extent to which the plant microbiome influences the overall fitness of the plant, which can go beyond the traits provided by plant genomes. Plants are able to specifically select their microbiome from the environment. The composition of the plant microbiome is dependent on the soil type, plant species (Berg and Smalla 2009).

The aim of the project potatoMETAbiome is to provide a new strategy for sustainable plant breeding. The ground-breaking concept of this project is based on using a large potato genotype bank (BRC) as basis for the selection of potato varieties that most effectively interact with soil microbes. The project is separated in five work packages. The first work package (WP1) focuses on the project management, dissemination and communication. In WP2 an initial pool of 1400 genotypes available at BRC will be screened in silico for relevant traits. The most promising 200 genotypes will be further tested using in vitro plants in climate chambers experiments for microbial interaction traits (MITs) (WP2). Subsequently, the 50 genotypes with higher MITs will be evaluated in greenhouse experiments in three different locations, where both plant (genome, transcriptome and metabolome) and microbiome aspects will be assessed, thus providing an overview of the functional genomic variations, microbiome and MITs (WP2-4), their higher resource use efficiency (WP3) and resistance to (a)biotic stress (WP4).

Finally, a selection of 10 genotypes will be evaluated further for their performance for the already mentioned functions in field trials in three countries. The data generated in field trails will be used to provide a social, economic and environmental perspective on how the new cultivars with higher MITs and associated biologicals can impact potato cropping, thus supporting sustainable production (WP5). A schematic overview of all project tasks is provided in Figure 1.



Figure 1: Project structure outlining different Work Packages (WPs), their operational links and proposed approaches.

## 2.2 Work Package 4 (biotic stress) – Strategies to improve potato resilience to biotic stress – Lead: Institute of Environmental Biotechnology (TU Graz)

The aim of WP4 is to promote the sustainable use of European arable soils through the development of potato cultivars that are resistant to biotic stress. The implementation of potato cultivars that are resistant to biotic stress will have great economic, environmental, and human health impact through the reduction in the input of pesticides. In this context, the use of microbial biological control agents represents a viable alternative, by promoting the successful suppression of the phytopathogens (*Rhizoctonia solani* and *Verticillium dahliae*) in the rhizosphere or phyllosphere. The efficiency of the biocontrol method depends on the survival of the biocontrol agent in the soil and efficient rhizosphere colonization, the latter being mediated by signal molecules, which are not well understood. Furthermore, the success of the applied bioinoculants also depends on how the introduced organisms interact with the complex biota living in the soil. Thus, regarding biotic stress, WP4 aims at improving promising biologicals with so far unexploited strategies. Specifically, we will com-

bine the use of beneficial consortia with novel formulation technologies to increase the applicability (shelf life) and efficiency (exploitation of microbial Volatile Organic Compounds [mVOC] activation in the strains).

For this approach, 10+1 genotypes will be combined by TU Graz with four-strain microbial consortia in combination with two formulations (consortia and/or formulation + pathogen). Microbial community profiling by amplicon sequencing will enable to assess responses of the indigenous soil microbiota to the introduced inoculate and the fate of the introduced microbial consortia throughout the plant's life cycle. Plant-microbiome interactions will be determined by plant transcriptomic approaches and metabolite analyses of the potato plants.

Subsequently, one of the project partners, the Technical University of Munich, will identify the mechanisms conferring higher biotic and abiotic resistance by performing meta-transcriptomics on the selected 10+1 genotypes, grown under greenhouse conditions, in the presence and absence of pathogens, under no abiotic stress, and in the absence of pathogen but under drought conditions.

By understanding the impact and fate of the introduced biocontrol in the soils and by developing a new method of application that improves efficiency, WP4 will generate knowledge that can be implemented in other biocontrol programs.

It will produce key information (genes, metabolites) on the resistance of the selected genotypes to both biotic and abiotic stress, thus contributing to predictive breeding technologies and development of new potato genotypes selected for improvement in plant health, protection, and resistance.

In summary, WP4 will contribute to a reduction in the environmental footprint of pesticide use in potato cropping by selecting efficient biocontrol microbial consortia that improve the resistance of the selected genotypes to biotic stress (the fungal soil-borne pathogens *V. dahliae* [Verticillium wilt] and *R. solani* [black scurf]), thus supporting the development and exploitation of novel integrated disease methods and practices.

## 3 Results

The main aim of WP 4 is to investigate novel, bio-based strategies to improve potato resilience to biotic stress.

## **3.1 Deliverables**

Deliverable 1: Definition of four bacterial consortia with enhanced activity against potato pathogens and two prototype formulations.

Deliverable 2: Impact of inoculation on plant omics and indigenous microbial communities.

Deliverable 3: Report on mechanisms leading to higher resistance to stress.

### **3.2 Procedure for constructing the 4 four-strain bacterial consortia**

For constructing the microbial consortia, we selected promising microbial isolates from the strain collection of antagonist microorganisms (SCAM), Institute of Environmental Biotechnology, TU Graz, Austria and screened them in vitro against *Rhizoctonia solani* and *Verticillium dahliae*. Then we selected the 25 most promising isolates, respectively, combined them to consortia and screened them again against the two model pathogens. After that, various natural extracts were added that served as so called 'boosters' for the consortia. Boosters act as positive supporters during establishment of the microorganisms in the new micro-habitat and generally improve the effect of the microbial consortia by provision of specific nutrients or enhancement of their antagonistic activity.

### 3.2.1 Microorganisms selected for the project

In the first step, we selected antagonistic isolates with antagonistic effects against the two model pathogens (*R. solani* and *V. dahliae*) from the 'in house' SCAM library (Fig. 2).

Bacillus amyloliquefaciens 4P2-4	1	P. putida L22-6-9	40	Promising isolates of tomato A3	78
Bacillus amyloliquefaciens Sc-K143	2	P. putida L32-6-8	41	Promising isolates of tomato A4	79
Bacillus subtilis Sc-S7	3	P. putida L11-1-3	42	Promising isolates of tomato A5	80
Bacillus subtilis 1Pe4-13	4	P. putida L8-6-2	43	Promising isolates of tomato A6	81
Enterobacter intermedius 4Rz1	5	P. putida L8-6-9	44	Promising isolates of tomato A9	82
Erwinia crysanthemi LC21-3-3	6	P.putida B 6Kp8	45	Promising isolates of tomato A10	83
Erwinia rhapontici 1Pe1-14	7	Pseudomonas trivialis 3Re2-7 *23	46	Promising isolates of tomato A11	84
Paenibacillus peoriae 1P1-2	8	Pseudomonas reactans 3Re2-7	47	Promising isolates of tomato A12	85
Pseudomonas chlororaphis L9-2-5	9	Serratia fonticola 3Rc3	48	Promising isolates of tomato B7	86
Pseudomonas chlororaphis L30-3-6	10	Serratia fonticola R6	49	Promising isolates of tomato B8	87
Pseudomonas chlororaphis L30-3-8	11	Serratia arimesii 4Rz6	50	Promising isolates of tomato B9	88
Pseudomonas chlororaphis L30-3-9	12	Serratia arimesii 38.08	51	Promising isolates of tomato B11	89
Pseudomonas chlororaphis 6R4-28	13	Serratia arimesii 9Ez29	52	Promising isolates of tomato B12	90
Pseudomonas chlororaphis 6Kp10	14	Serratia arimesii 98.210	53	Promising isolates of tomato C12	91
Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-12	15	Secratio arimesii 9824	54	Promising isolates of tomato D2	92
Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-6	16	Secratia arimesii R15	55	Promising isolates of tomato D3	93
Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-21	17	Serratio arimesii R11	55	Promising isolates of tomato D8	94
Pseudomonas fluorescens 2R1-7	18	Secretio animesii 116.2.3	57	Promising isolates of tomato D9	95
Pseudomonas fluorescens 2Re2-6*	19	Serratio grimesii [21-3-3	59	Promising isolates of tomato D10	95
Pseudomonas fluorescens L13-6-12	20	Serratio adarifera R1	50	Promising isolates of tomato D10	97
P. putida 8Kz4	21	Serratio adacidera AP-12	55	Promising isolates of tomato D12	
P. putida 8Kz8	22	Serratio oborijero 44X15	60	Promising isolates of tomato D12	30
P. putida 4Kc15	23	Serratia plymuthica SRE4-18	61	Promising isolates of tomato E1	100
P. putida 8Rr24	24	Serratia plymutnica HKO-C48 (oliseea rape)	62	Promising isolates of tomato E2	100
P. putida 4Kc13	25	Serratia proteamaculans 38c15	63	Promising isolates of tomato E4	101
P. putida 10Kx10/2	26	Streptomyces rocnei 5K3-11	64	Promising isolates of tomato ES	102
P. putida 9Bc8	27	Streptomyces setonii RP87	65	Promising isolates of tomato E8	103
P. putida 9Bc3	28	Trichoderma gamsii AT1-2-4 (sugar beet)	66	Promising isolates of tomato E10	104
P. putida 3R1-19	29	Trichoderma velutinum G1/8; FN675871	67	Promising isolates of tomato E11	105
P. putida 6R5-24	30	Xenorhabdus nematophilus R19	68	Promising isolates of tomato E12	106
P. putido SRel-25	31	Promising isolates of tomato Ale 1	69	Promising isolates of tomato F7	107
P. putido 5R2-27	32	Promising isolates of tomato Ale 2	70	Promising isolates of tomato F8	108
P. putido 3Re4-21	33	Promising isolates of tomato Ale 3	71	Ralstonia pickettii CE1	109
P. putida 5Re2-6	34	Promising isolates of tomato Ale 4	72	Ralstonia pickettii CE5	110
P. putida 5Re2-10	35	Promising isolates of tomato Ale 5	73	Ralstonia pickettii CE11	111
P. putida SRe2-17	36	Promising isolates of tomato Ale 6	74	Bacillus subtilis Sc-S7	112
P. putida 5Re2-28	37	Promising isolates of tomato Ale 7	75	Bacillus amyloliquefaciens Rs-Ms-87	113
P. putida L7-2-3	38	Promising isolates of tomato A1	76	Bacillus amyloliquefaciens Sc-K143	114
P. putida L12-5-4	39	Promising isolates of tomato A2	77	Bacillus aerius Rs-Ts-276	115

Figure 2: List of the selected strains that were obtained from SCAM (Strain collection of antagonist microorganisms, Institute of Environmental Biotechnology, TU Graz, Austria).

### **3.2.2** Screening of isolates

In total, 115 isolates were screened in triplicates in each assay. The antagonistic effect of soluble metabolites (Dual culture assay 'DCA') (Fig. 3a, b) and volatiles (6-well Two Clamp VOCs Assay 'TCVA' and Petri Dish VOCs Assay 'PDVA') against the pathogens *R. solani* and *V. dahliae* were investigated. During the first assessments, the two pathogen models showed different growth characteristics. Therefore, we had to adjust the set-up of the DCA and VOCs assays, we tested the antagonistic effect of VOCs against the mycelia of *R. solani* and the spores of *V. dahliae* by using the PDVA. For investigating the antagonistic effect against the mycelia of *V. dahliae* we chose the TCVA (Fig 3c,d; Fig 4a,b). For performing the DCA's we tested the antagonistic effect against the mycelia of R. solani and the spores of *V. dahliae*.

Evaluation of the antagonistic effect of the isolates' metabolites via DCA showed inhibition zones between 6 and 10 mm against the mycelia of *R. solani* (Fig. 3a) and between 4 and 13 mm against the spores of *V. dahliae* (Fig. 3b). The antagonistic inhibition rates of VOCs



of the best performing 25 isolates were between 17% and 73% against mycelium formation of *R. solani* (Fig. 6c) and between 7% and 56% (Fig. 6d) against *V. dahliae*.

Figure 3: Antagonistic effect of the metabolites and volatiles of the 25 best performing isolates against fungal pathogens. (a) Dual culture assay against *R. solani* (mycelia) on Waksman agar. The inhibition zone in mm was measured after the control was overgrown with fungal mycelia. (b) Dual culture assay against *V. dahliae* (mycelia) on Waksman agar. The inhibition zone in mm was measured after the control was overgrown with fungal mycelia. (b) Dual culture assay against *V. dahliae* (mycelia) on Waksman agar. The inhibition zone in mm was measured after the control was overgrown with fungal mycelia. (c) Relative inhibition of volatiles against *R. solani*. The assay was stopped after the fungal mycelia of the control reached the rim of the Petri dish. (d) Relative inhibition of volatiles against *V. dahliae*. (mycelia) The TCVA was stopped after 11 days. All assays were performed in triplicates.

The PDVA assays with the selected isolates against the spores of *V. dahliae* were conducted in triplicates. The inhibition grade per isolate was summarized to a total inhibition grade for the evaluation. The 25 best performing isolates showed inhibition grades between one and five (Fig. 4).



Figure 4: **Antagonistic effect of the volatiles of the 25 best performing isolates against fungal pathogens**. (a) PDVA against *V. dahliae* (spores). The inhibition grade was visually measured after six days of incubation. 5,000 fungal spores per assay were applied. The assay was performed in triplicates. (b) Visuable inhibition grade from 'C' control, '0' no inhibition to '3' very high inhibition. The Inhibition grade 4 for one isolate shows no fungal growth. The sum of the three results per isolate reveals the inhibition grade (maximum inhibition grade is 12).

### 3.2.3 Screening of consortia

The 25 best performing isolates per assay were selected and combined to assemble four strain consortia. The aim of the construction of consortia was to cover the best performing isolates per assay in one consortium (Tab. 1). Therefore, isolates were ranked in each assay and combined (e.g. Isolate 1 was the best performing in DCA *V. dahliae* spores, isolate 2 was the best performing in DCA *R. solani* mycelia and so on). For the other consortia we changed the isolates per assay. The best performing isolate in PDVA was replaced with the second-best performing isolate. With this procedure we covered all antagonistic effects against the two pathogens. Additionally, we reduced the risk of antagonistic effect within the consortia. It is possible, that the best performing isolates are supporting each other.

Table 1: **Example of the procedure that was implemented for consortia combinations.** The aim was to construct the consortia based on the best performing isolates in the five implemented assays.

Consortia	PDVA	DCA	TCVA	PDVA	DCA
	nycelia	<i>R. solani</i> mycelia	v. danilae mycelia	spores	v. aannae spores
Isolate 1	_	3	-	-	1

Isolate 2	-	1	11	-	-
Isolate 3	-	-	1	5	-
Isolate 4	1	-	-	-	-

On some occasions it was observed that single microorganisms themselves do not show antagonistic effects, but in combination with other strains they do. Therefore, we decided to also include the five worst isolates in the combination during testing to avoid omitting potential antagonists.

In total 180 different consortia were tested for antagonistic effects against the pathogens (Fig. 5).

1         14         12         3         66         4         110         20         120         6         100         111         71           2         111         122         13         66         6         90         3         4         100         111         101	Consortia		Isol	lates		61	4	111	24	48		121	6	109	101	71
2         1.1         1.2         1.3         64         1.09         2.3         64           3         1.6         1.22         1.3         66         4         1.5         32         48           5         1.2         1.3         66         4         1.5         32         48           6         1.4         1.3         66         4         1.3         34         48           7         1.4         97         3.5         66         4         1.0         34         48           7         1.4         97         3.5         66         4         1.0         34         48           10         1.3         4.3         1.3         4.4         1.6         1.3         4.4           10         1.3         1.3         1.3         1.3         1.3         1.0         1.0         1.0           11         1.4         1.2         2.4         4.6         1.0         3.4         1.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.3         3.	1	114	112	13	66	62	4	114	24	48	ł	122	6	109	115	71
3         16         122         13         66         4         15         32         45           5         12         12         13         66         4         11         34         48           6         14         4         13         166         66         4         104         34         48           7         134         97         13         66         66         4         104         34         48           8         134         13         66         66         4         104         34         48           9         134         13         66         7         102         36           13         134         132         13         66         7         14         16         73         44           13         134         132         13         66         7         4         16         73         44         16         73         44         16         73         133         13         13         132         13         13         13         13         13         13         13         13         13         13         13         13	2	111	112	13	66	64	4	109	24	40	ł	125	6	109	101	36
4         30         112         13         66         4         11.         32         48           5         12         12         13         66         100         101         12         36           6         114         47         13         66         4         106         34         48           10         114         17         36         66         4         100         34         48           10         114         122         24         66         7         142         16         313         131         15         107         162         35           11         122         144         122         36         66         7         4         16         30         48         30         48         30         13 <td< td=""><td>3</td><td>16</td><td>112</td><td>13</td><td>66</td><td>65</td><td>4</td><td>15</td><td>24</td><td>48</td><td>ł</td><td>125</td><td>6</td><td>109</td><td>101</td><td>86</td></td<>	3	16	112	13	66	65	4	15	24	48	ł	125	6	109	101	86
5         12         12         13         66           6         14         4         13         66           7         134         97         13         66           8         144         13         15         16           8         144         13         13         66           9         134         13         66         7         16         134         13         16         17         4         16         13         44           13         134         132         23         66         7         4         16         7         16         13 <th13< th=""> <th13< th=""> <th13< th="">         &lt;</th13<></th13<></th13<>	4	30	112	13	66	66	4	81	24	48	ł	126	6	109	101	12
6         114         97         113         66         7         124         130         63         7         112         95           8         114         112         13         66         70         4         116         130         48           90         114         112         23         66         70         4         116         130         48           120         114         112         23         66         77         4         116         67         48           121         112         113         110 </td <td>5</td> <td>12</td> <td>112</td> <td>13</td> <td>66</td> <td>67</td> <td>4</td> <td>108</td> <td>24</td> <td>48</td> <td>1</td> <td>127</td> <td>15</td> <td>7</td> <td>102</td> <td>36</td>	5	12	112	13	66	67	4	108	24	48	1	127	15	7	102	36
7       114       97       13       68         8       114       13       13       64         9       114       13       64         9       114       112       20       66         9       114       112       20       66         114       112       120       66       77.       4       16       70       48         13       114       112       120       66       77.       4       16       107       48         13       114       112       150       66       77.       4       16       107       48         13       114       112       15       66       77.       4       16       112       48         14       112       15       66       77.       4       16       112       48         14       112       13       67       4       16       112       48       102       113       102       102       113       102         15       112       13       67       13       68       4       16       24       66       135       67       135       <	6	114	4	13	66	68	4	104	24	48	1	128	6	7	102	36
b         11.1         11.1         11.2         12.6         10.1         11.2         12.6         10.1         11.2         12.6         12.6         12.7         12.6         12.6         12.7         12.6         12.6         12.7         12.6         12.6         12.7         12.6         12	7	114	97	13	66	69	4	110	24	48	[	129	94	7	102	36
10         114         112         28         68           11         114         112         124         66           12         114         112         110         66           13         114         112         110         66           13         114         112         110         66           13         114         112         116         66           14         112         116         66         77         4         116         116         113         115         13         107         116           14         112         115         66         77         4         116         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         48         110         110         110         110         110         110         110         110         110         110         110         110         110         110         110         110	9	114	15	13	00	70	4	16	13	48		130	98	7	102	36
11         114         112         124         125         66           135         114         112         13         66         77         4         16         112         45         135         15         7         111         35           136         112         13         65         77         4         16         112         45         112         136         115         7         102         12           131         112         13         60         78         4         16         24         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         124         1	10	114	112	28	66	71	4	16	28	48		131	15	109	102	36
12         114         112         110         66           13         114         112         110         66           14         114         112         186         66           15         114         112         156         66           17         114         112         156         66           17         114         112         13         66           17         144         112         13         67         4         16         110         46           18         142         112         13         67         4         16         110         46           19         114         112         13         67         4         16         24         66           21         114         112         13         67         4         16         24         66           22         114         112         13         67         4         16         24         66         39         115         86           22         114         112         13         67         74         16         24         66         244         94         100 <td>11</td> <td>114</td> <td>112</td> <td>24</td> <td>66</td> <td>72</td> <td>4</td> <td>16</td> <td>67</td> <td>48</td> <td>ł</td> <td>132</td> <td>15</td> <td>39</td> <td>102</td> <td>36</td>	11	114	112	24	66	72	4	16	67	48	ł	132	15	39	102	36
13         114         112         109         66         7         4         130         131         134         135         17         131         35           134         112         12         16         66         7         4         18         30         44         135         44         145         24         145         245         146         145         44         145         24         145         145         145         44         145         24         145         145         145         145         145         145         145         145         145         145         145	12	114	112	110	66	73	4	16	109	48	ł	133	15	13	102	36
14       112       84       66       72       4       15       126       15       126       15       126       15       126       15       126       15       127       134       112       15       156       15       7       100       25         17       114       112       13       66       77       4       16       110       48       137       15       7       100       25       12       114       112       13       67       4       16       14       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16       16<	13	114	112	109	66	74	4	16	30	48	ł	134	15	7	115	36
15       114       112       16       66       77       4       15       110       48         16       114       112       13       63       77       4       16       110       48         17       114       112       13       63       78       4       16       110       48         19       114       112       13       64       16       24       16       110       48         20       114       112       13       67       4       16       24       14       15       99       115       85         21       114       112       13       67       4       16       24       14       99       101       155       85         22       114       112       13       67       4       16       24       144       94       100       115       85         23       114       112       13       67       4       16       24       45       144       94       100       115       85         25       114       122       13       45       24       46       24       94       130	14	114	112	84	66	73	4	16	30	40	ł	135	15	7	102	71
1611411213661711411213651811411213481911411213482011411213672111411213672311411213672411411213672511411213672611411213672711411213672814416246025114112136526114112136727116397282814663972816639728166397290416244629639728915067156730639728913066156730661567312928341108728351116773361106737111871531111123215972834130111123511063973610066156737 <t< td=""><td>15</td><td>114</td><td>112</td><td>16</td><td>66</td><td>70</td><td>4</td><td>16</td><td>112</td><td>40</td><td>ł</td><td>137</td><td>15</td><td>7</td><td>102</td><td>86</td></t<>	15	114	112	16	66	70	4	16	112	40	ł	137	15	7	102	86
11114112136313114112136713144112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714112136714639728146397281463972815636728116397281216871513106377136637281411167721563771116477123146713494131156213513311114214871563631677281713064136636713714 <td>16</td> <td>114</td> <td>112</td> <td>15</td> <td>66</td> <td>78</td> <td>4</td> <td>16</td> <td>110</td> <td>48</td> <td>ł</td> <td>138</td> <td>15</td> <td>7</td> <td>102</td> <td>12</td>	16	114	112	15	66	78	4	16	110	48	ł	138	15	7	102	12
15         154         152         153         154         152         155	18	114	112	13	48	79	4	16	24	66	1	139	94	39	115	86
50         1:4         1:12         1:3         6:2           21         114         112         1:3         6:0           22         114         112         1:3         6:0           23         114         112         1:3         4:0           24         114         112         1:3         4:0           24         114         112         1:3         4:0           25         1:4         1:2         1:3         6:0           26         1:4         1:2         1:3         6:0           27         1:1         6:3         9:7         2:8           80         4         1:6         2:4         4:6           1:4         0:3         9:7         2:8           9:0         4:1         1:6         2:4         4:6           1:1         6:7         2:8         9:0         4:1         1:6         2:4           1:1         0:3         9:7         2:8         9:0         1:1         8:7         1:5           1:1         0:3         9:7         2:8         9:0         1:1         8:7         1:1         1:1         1:1         1:1<	10	114	112	13	87	80	4	16	24	63	1	140	15	39	115	86
21         114         112         13         607           22         114         112         13         607           23         114         112         13         101           24         114         112         13         667           25         114         112         13         667           26         114         112         13         667           27         11         63         97         28           86         4         16         24         67           28         114         63         97         28           87         4         16         24         67           30         50         63         97         28           90         30         63         97         28           91         100         66         97         28           93         111         87         5         67           93         111         87         5         67           35         100         63         97         28           93         111         87         5         67	20	114	112	13	62	81	4	16	24	87	[	141	6	39	115	86
22114112134747484162460144941001158523114112134541634104144941091158525114112136785416341041459419911586261141121367864163446146943910186271166397288941634451489439111862711663972889416344513911571353911512312096597289911187156713515131111233816397289911487156713515131111235204659728963066156713515131111236111669728993062156713516098131111237111669728100306615671351609813111123811120	21	114	112	13	60	82	4	16	24	62	[	142	98	39	115	86
23         114         112         13         104           24         114         112         13         86           25         114         112         13         86           26         114         112         13         86           27         111         63         97         28           28         114         63         97         28           28         114         63         97         28           29         15         63         97         28           30         50         65         97         28           91         30         87         72         88         4         16         24         109           31         206         63         97         28         90         4         16         24         109           31         208         63         97         28         91         111         87         15         67           35         204         63         97         28         30         64         15         67           35         204         63         97         28 <td< td=""><td>22</td><td>114</td><td>112</td><td>13</td><td>47</td><td>83</td><td>4</td><td>16</td><td>24</td><td>60</td><td></td><td>143</td><td>94</td><td>101</td><td>115</td><td>86</td></td<>	22	114	112	13	47	83	4	16	24	60		143	94	101	115	86
24       114       112       13       45       85       4       16       24       104       125       114       112       13       66         25       114       112       13       67       36       4       16       24       45       94       13       115       86         27       111       63       97       28       36       4       16       24       47         30       16       63       97       28       30       4       16       24       47         31       209       63       97       28       90       4       16       24       109       150       94       39       115       15         32       15       63       97       28       90       6       77       15       67       155       67       153       13       111       12         33       81       63       97       28       96       30       615       67       156       61       13       111       12         35       204       63       97       28       30       62       15       67       156	23	114	112	13	104	84	4	16	24	47	ļ	144	94	109	115	86
25       114       112       13       86       86       4       16       24       45       126       94       39       102       86         27       111       63       97       28       114       67       87       4       16       24       86       147       94       39       100       86         28       114       63       97       28       90       4       16       24       86       148       94       39       111       86         30       56       97       28       90       4       16       24       86       148       94       39       1115       51         31       209       63       97       28       91       30       87       15       67       151       13       111       12       33       111       86       97       28       96       30       66       15       67       153       15       13       111       12       13       111       12       13       111       12       13       111       12       13       111       12       13       111       12       13       111	24	114	112	13	45	85	4	16	24	104		145	94	13	115	86
27       114       112       13       67       28       4       16       24       86       147       94       39       101       86         28       114       63       97       28       88       4       16       24       67         29       16       63       97       28       90       4       16       24       45         30       30       63       97       28       90       4       16       24       45       130       94       39       111       86         31       209       63       97       28       90       4       16       24       45       16       77       15       67         31       206       63       97       28       93       111       87       15       67         35       104       63       97       28       30       63       15       67         36       111       64       97       28       30       63       13       111       12         37       111       64       97       28       30       63       15       67       155 <th< td=""><td>25</td><td>114</td><td>112</td><td>13</td><td>86</td><td>86</td><td>4</td><td>16</td><td>24</td><td>45</td><td>ł</td><td>146</td><td>94</td><td>39</td><td>102</td><td>86</td></th<>	25	114	112	13	86	86	4	16	24	45	ł	146	94	39	102	86
27       111       63       97       28       114       63       97       28         28       114       63       97       28       98       4       16       24       45       39       111       36         29       16       63       97       28       99       4       16       24       45       139       39       115       36         30       53       97       28       99       4       16       24       45       139       94       39       115       71         31       209       63       97       28       92       16       87       15       67       153       15       13       111       12         34       06       97       28       97       30       63       15       67       155       67       155       68       101       111       12         35       114       64       97       28       30       48       15       67       155       78       39       111       12         39       111       64       97       28       30       62       15       67	20	114	112	13	67	87	4	16	24	86	ł	147	94	39	101	86
28         10         63         97         28           30         63         97         28           31         109         63         97         28           32         15         63         97         28           31         109         63         97         28           32         15         63         97         28           34         208         63         97         28           34         208         63         97         28           34         208         63         97         28           35         204         63         97         28           36         97         28           39         111         87         15         67           36         30         66         15         67           37         111         66         97         28           39         111         87         97         28           39         111         60         97         28           39         111         60         97         28           4111         63         4	2/	114	63	97	28	88	4	16	24	67	ł	148	94	39	111	36
30 $63$ $97$ $28$ $91$ $30$ $87$ $13$ $67$ $15$ $67$ $31$ $209$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $32$ $15$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $33$ $81$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $34$ $208$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $34$ $208$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $34$ $208$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $34$ $208$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $35$ $110$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $36$ $110$ $66$ $97$ $28$ $37$ $30$ $63$ $15$ $67$ $37$ $111$ $66$ $97$ $28$ $39$ $111$ $87$ $93$ $06$ $15$ $67$ $39$ $111$ $62$ $97$ $28$ $39$ $111$ $62$ $97$ $28$ $100$ $30$ $60$ $15$ $67$ $111$ $66$ $97$ $28$ $100$ $30$ $47$ $15$ $67$ $111$ $66$ $97$ $28$ $100$ $30$ $87$ $126$ $67$ $111$ $63$ $12$ $28$ $106$ $30$ $87$ $126$ $67$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $106$ $30$ $87$ $126$ $67$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $28$ $106$ $30$ $87$ $15$ $136$ $111$ $63$ $97$	29	16	63	97	28	8	4	16	24	40	ł	150	94	39	115	71
312096397283215639728338163972834208639728352046397283610063972837111669728391118715673911166972839111669728391116797283911167972840111629728411116097281003060156711167972810230104156710330871567111631122810330871567111631122810330871567111631122810330871567111639713111639713111639713111639713111639713111639713111639713111639711163971116397111<	30	30	63	97	28	91	30	87	15	67	ł	151	94	39	115	12
32       15       63       97       28         33       81       63       97       28         34       205       63       97       28         35       204       63       97       28         35       100       63       97       28         37       111       66       97       28         37       111       66       97       28         38       111       48       97       28         39       111       66       97       28         39       111       66       97       28         39       111       66       97       28         40       111       66       97       28         30       111       66       97       28         30       0       67       15       67         111       60       97       28         111       67       728         100       30       67       15       67         111       67       97       28         102       30       103       111       31       111 <t< td=""><td>31</td><td>109</td><td>63</td><td>97</td><td>28</td><td>92</td><td>16</td><td>87</td><td>15</td><td>67</td><td></td><td>152</td><td>98</td><td>13</td><td>111</td><td>12</td></t<>	31	109	63	97	28	92	16	87	15	67		152	98	13	111	12
33         81         63         97         28           34         108         63         97         28           35         100         63         97         28           36         110         63         97         28           36         110         63         97         28           37         111         66         97         28           38         111         48         97         28           99         111         66         97         28           99         111         62         97         28           99         30         62         15         67           111         60         97         28           100         30         60         15         67           100         30         64         15         67           100         30         87         15         67           111         65         97         28           101         67         97         28           103         30         87         15         67           111         63         112<	32	15	63	97	28	93	111	87	15	67	1	153	15	13	111	12
34         208         63         97         28           35         204         63         97         28           36         110         63         97         28           37         111         66         97         28           38         121         48         97         28           38         111         48         97         28           39         111         66         97         28           99         30         62         15         67           111         60         97         28           100         30         60         15         67           101         30         67         15         67           102         30         104         15         67           102         30         104         15         67           104         98         13         111         12           44         111         67         97         28           105         30         109         15         67           164         98         13         1111         71 <t< td=""><td>33</td><td>81</td><td>63</td><td>97</td><td>28</td><td>94</td><td>114</td><td>87</td><td>15</td><td>67</td><td>1</td><td>154</td><td>94</td><td>13</td><td>111</td><td>12</td></t<>	33	81	63	97	28	94	114	87	15	67	1	154	94	13	111	12
35         204         63         97         28           36         110         63         97         28           37         111         66         97         28           38         111         48         97         28           39         111         66         97         28           39         111         62         97         28           39         111         62         97         28           100         30         60         15         67           111         60         97         28           101         30         60         15         67           102         30         104         15         67           102         30         104         15         67           102         30         104         15         67           103         30         86         15         67           104         30         109         15         67           105         30         109         12         67           111         63         112         28           106	34	108	63	97	28	95	12	87	15	67	[	155	6	13	111	12
36         110         63         97         28           37         111         66         97         28           38         111         48         97         28           39         111         87         97         28           40         111         62         97         28           40         111         62         97         28           100         30         60         15         67           111         60         97         28           101         30         47         15         67           111         67         97         28           102         30         104         15         67           102         30         104         15         67           102         30         104         15         67           105         30         107         30         87         166           111         63         112         28           104         30         87         15         67           111         63         31         28         107         30         87 <td>35</td> <td>104</td> <td>63</td> <td>97</td> <td>28</td> <td>96</td> <td>30</td> <td>66</td> <td>15</td> <td>67</td> <td></td> <td>156</td> <td>98</td> <td>101</td> <td>111</td> <td>12</td>	35	104	63	97	28	96	30	66	15	67		156	98	101	111	12
37         111         66         97         28           38         111         45         97         28           39         111         67         97         28           40         111         62         97         28           100         30         60         15         67           41         111         60         97         28           42         111         47         97         28           43         111         204         97         28           102         30         45         15         67           111         67         97         28           103         30         45         15         67           104         30         45         15         67           105         30         109         15         67           106         30         87         12         67           106         30         87         12         67           106         30         87         12         67           111         63         12         28           50         1	30	110	63	97	28	97	30	63	15	67	ļ	157	98	39	111	12
39 $111$ $37$ $97$ $28$ $40$ $111$ $62$ $97$ $28$ $40$ $111$ $62$ $97$ $28$ $41$ $111$ $60$ $97$ $28$ $41$ $111$ $60$ $97$ $28$ $43$ $111$ $204$ $97$ $28$ $43$ $111$ $204$ $97$ $28$ $44$ $111$ $86$ $97$ $28$ $44$ $111$ $86$ $97$ $28$ $101$ $30$ $45$ $15$ $67$ $163$ $98$ $13$ $111$ $36$ $47$ $111$ $63$ $112$ $28$ $47$ $111$ $63$ $112$ $28$ $106$ $30$ $87$ $112$ $67$ $111$ $63$ $112$ $28$ $106$ $30$ $87$ $112$ $67$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $13$ $51$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $13$ $51$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $13$ $54$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $54$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $54$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $55$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ <td>3/</td> <td>111</td> <td>48</td> <td>97</td> <td>28</td> <td>98</td> <td>30</td> <td>48</td> <td>15</td> <td>67</td> <td></td> <td>158</td> <td>98</td> <td>109</td> <td>111</td> <td>12</td>	3/	111	48	97	28	98	30	48	15	67		158	98	109	111	12
40111 $62$ $97$ $28$ $41$ 111 $60$ $97$ $28$ $42$ 111 $47$ $97$ $28$ $43$ 111 $204$ $97$ $28$ $44$ 111 $86$ $97$ $28$ $44$ 111 $85$ $97$ $28$ $44$ 111 $85$ $97$ $28$ $44$ 111 $63$ $97$ $28$ $45$ 111 $67$ $97$ $28$ $46$ 111 $63$ $4$ $28$ $47$ 111 $63$ $112$ $28$ $47$ 111 $63$ $112$ $28$ $106$ $30$ $87$ $4$ $67$ $106$ $30$ $87$ $112$ $67$ $106$ $30$ $87$ $112$ $67$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $13$ $51$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $13$ $51$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $13$ $54$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $54$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $55$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $55$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $55$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ $63$ $97$ $15$ $56$ $111$ $63$ <t< td=""><td>39</td><td>111</td><td>87</td><td>97</td><td>28</td><td>99</td><td>30</td><td>62</td><td>15</td><td>67</td><td>ł</td><td>159</td><td>98</td><td>13</td><td>102</td><td>12</td></t<>	39	111	87	97	28	99	30	62	15	67	ł	159	98	13	102	12
411116097284211147972843111204972844111869728451116797284611163428471116342810630871567107308711267481116311228481116312228491116312228491116312281083087109671093087151311163971351111639713511116397155111163971554111639715551116397151116397151133087155511163975511624481179410910171128114161313898109137161313898109139416138981091391141613897136139137 <td>40</td> <td>111</td> <td>62</td> <td>97</td> <td>28</td> <td>100</td> <td>30</td> <td>60</td> <td>15</td> <td>67</td> <td>ł</td> <td>160</td> <td>98</td> <td>13</td> <td>115</td> <td>12</td>	40	111	62	97	28	100	30	60	15	67	ł	160	98	13	115	12
4211147972843111204972844111869728451116797284511167972846111634284711163112284811163112284911163112285011163302850111639713511116397135111163971352111639713531116397155411163971555111639715561162448117941091017112897126245911216245911216245911216245911216245911216245911216241131131091017111413087155116117166109101711141613510910111613136971371461389813	41	111	60	97	28	101	30	47	15	67	ł	161	98	13	101	76
43111 $204$ 972844111869728451116797284611163428471116312284811163122848111631228501116312285011163302850111633028501116397135111663972452111639713521116397135411163971554111639715551116397155411163971555111639756111639757416241898109101711141611398109114109101711141151091017111411612411794118981091011141611510911611117118119120111304513110014615	42	111	47	97	28	102	30	104	15	67	ł	163	90	13	111	86
4411185972845111679728461116342847111631122848111631122849111633028501116330285011163972810010087112675011163972811163971352111639724111639724111639715541116397155411163971554111639715551116397155611163971557416241589713611715899101711661710117711416188981091107111110613112106139113106114106115109116129117141661317711418010911110711211411310911411511510	43	111	104	97	28	104	30	45	15	67	ł	164	98	13	111	71
450       111       67       97       28         46       111       63       4       28         47       111       63       4       28         48       111       63       112       28         49       111       63       31       28         109       30       87       109       67         110       63       31       28         109       30       87       15       13         111       63       97       13       111       30       87       15         51       111       63       97       13       111       30       87       15       13         52       111       63       97       15       113       30       87       15       24         111       63       97       15       133       30       87       15       24         54       111       63       97       15       113       30       87       15       109         55       111       63       97       15       114       30       87       15       109       101 <t< td=""><td>44</td><td>111</td><td>86</td><td>97</td><td>28</td><td>105</td><td>30</td><td>109</td><td>15</td><td>67</td><td></td><td>165</td><td>6</td><td>7</td><td>101</td><td>71</td></t<>	44	111	86	97	28	105	30	109	15	67		165	6	7	101	71
47         111         63         4         28           47         111         63         12         28           48         111         63         12         28           49         111         63         31         28           59         111         63         30         28           51         111         63         97         13           51         111         63         97         13           51         111         63         97         13           51         111         63         97         15           111         63         97         15           111         63         97         15           111         63         97         15           112         30         87         15         24           113         30         87         15         24           114         30         87         15         100           112         36         113         30         87         15           113         30         87         15         100           114	45	111	67	97	28	106	30	87	4	67	1	166	94	7	115	86
111       63       12       28         48       111       63       31       28         49       111       63       31       28         50       111       63       30       87       109       67         51       111       63       97       13       110       30       87       15       13         51       111       63       97       24       111       30       87       15       13         53       111       63       97       24       112       30       87       15       28         54       111       63       97       112       30       87       15       28         55       111       63       97       45       112       30       87       15       10         111       30       87       15       10       17       111       62       97       10         55       111       63       97       15       114       30       87       15       10       174       48       46       13       28         55       111       63       97       100	40	111	E0	112	28	107	30	87	112	67	1	167	98	7	111	12
49       111       63       31       28         50       111       63       31       28         50       111       63       30       28         51       111       63       97       13         51       111       63       97       13         111       63       97       13       111       30       87       15       13         51       111       63       97       14       112       30       87       15       24         53       111       63       97       67       112       30       87       15       28         54       111       63       97       67       113       30       87       15       10         54       111       63       97       15       114       30       87       15       10         55       111       63       97       100       116       15       109       101       71         56       111       63       97       100       116       15       109       101       71         57       4       16       24 <td< td=""><td>48</td><td>111</td><td>63</td><td>12</td><td>28</td><td>108</td><td>30</td><td>87</td><td>109</td><td>67</td><td>[</td><td>168</td><td>15</td><td>7</td><td>101</td><td>71</td></td<>	48	111	63	12	28	108	30	87	109	67	[	168	15	7	101	71
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	49	111	63	31	28	109	30	87	16	67		169	111	62	31	28
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	50	111	63	30	28	110	30	87	15	13	ļ	170	111	62	97	67
52       111       63       97       24         53       111       63       97       67         54       111       63       97       67         54       116       63       97       112       30       87       15       45         55       111       63       97       15       113       30       87       15       45         56       111       63       97       45       115       6       109       101       71         56       111       63       97       100       116       15       109       101       71         57       4       16       24       48       117       94       109       101       71         58       97       16       24       48       118       98       109       101       71         59       112       16       24       48       119       6       39       101       71         178       114       16       13       11       190       6       19       101       71         59       112       16       24       48 <t< td=""><td>51</td><td>111</td><td>63</td><td>97</td><td>13</td><td>111</td><td>30</td><td>87</td><td>15</td><td>24</td><td></td><td>171</td><td>111</td><td>62</td><td>97</td><td>110</td></t<>	51	111	63	97	13	111	30	87	15	24		171	111	62	97	110
53         111         63         97         67         113         30         87         15         45         173         485         63         46         13           54         111         63         97         15         114         30         87         15         45         173         485         63         46         13           55         111         63         97         45         115         6         109         101         71           56         111         63         97         110         116         15         109         101         71         176         63         62         46         13         28           57         4         16         24         48         117         94         109         101         71         176         63         46         13         28           58         97         16         24         48         118         98         109         101         71         177         114         16         13         8           59         112         16         24         48         139         101         71         17	52	111	63	97	24	112	30	87	15	28		172	66	63	67	46
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	53	111	63	97	67	113	30	87	15	45		173	48	63	46	13
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	54	111	63	97	15	114	30	87	15	110		174	48	46	13	28
37         4         16         24         48         137         94         109         101         71         114         16         13         8           58         97         16         24         48         117         94         109         101         71         114         16         13         8           58         97         16         24         48         118         98         109         101         71         114         16         13         11           59         112         16         24         48         119         6         39         101         71         179         4         16         30         8           120         16         24         48         130         6         13         101         71         179         4         16         30         8		111	63	97	45	115	15	109	101	71	ł	175	63	45	13	28
58         97         16         24         48         118         98         109         101         71         178         114         16         13         11           59         112         16         24         48         119         6         39         101         71         178         114         16         13         11           59         112         16         24         48         119         6         39         101         71         179         4         16         13         11           59         112         16         24         48         119         6         19         101         71         179         4         16         13         11           120         12         16         24         48         119         6         101         71         179         4         16         30         8           120         12         16         24         48         120         71         180         4         16         30         11	57	4	16	24	48	117	94	109	101	71		177	114	16	13	8
59         112         16         24         48         119         6         39         101         71         179         4         16         30         8           60         12         16         24         48         119         6         39         101         71         179         4         16         30         8           10         12         16         24         48         120         6         13         101         71         180         4         16         30         11	58	97	16	24	48	118	98	109	101	71		178	114	16	13	11
60 12 16 24 48 120 6 13 100 71 180 4 16 30 11	59	112	16	24	48	119	6	39	101	71		179	4	16	30	8
100 V 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10	60	12	16	24	48	120	6	13	101	71	l	180	4	16	30	11

Figure 5: List of consortia including the isolate numbers that were included in the four-membered strain assemblies.

For investigation of these consortia, the same five assays were used (Fig. 6a-d). The TCVA consists of two plates, one containing the consortia, the other the pathogen, and they are fixed with two clamps. A perforated silicon foil with holes separates the two plates. Thus, chambers are formed, where the volatiles produced by the consortia can interact with the fungus (Fig. 6a). Same interaction is shown through the PDVA. Herein, two Petri dishes are faced to each other. One is holding the fungal mycelia and the other contains the consortia. The PDVA is sealed with a Parafilm (Fig. 6b). In the DCA the four strains of the consortia are streaked out and tested against fungal mycelia of *R. solani* (Fig. 6c) or spores of *V. dahliae* (Fig. 6d).



Figure 6: **The assays used for investigating antagonistic effects of consortia against fungal pathogens.** (a) TCVA against *V. dahliae* (mycelia). (b) PDVA against fungal mycelia of *R. solani* and spores of *V. dahliae*. (c) DCA against fungal mycelia of *R. solani*. (d) DCA against fungal spores of *V. dahliae*.

In addition, it was assessed if there is a substantial difference between streaking the consortia and homogenizing them with defined amounts of liquid buffer per isolate against *R. solani*. For the design of the consortia, 250  $\mu$ l per isolate with an OD<sub>600</sub> of 0.8 were mixed to a total amount of 1,000  $\mu$ l. Differences between these two assays were seen. The first divergence was the different antagonistic effect against *R. solani*. The PDVAs with the mixed consortia showed lower inhibition rates (Fig. 7b, Fig. 8), than the PDVAs with the streaked isolates. Additionally, some of the PDVAs with the streaked isolates illustrated an uneven inhibition (Fig. 7a). Based on the uneven growth we assumed, that some microorganisms of the consortia metabolize one or more volatiles of their consortium-partners. This would explain the lower antagonistic effect of the mixed consortia.



Figure 7: **Antagonistic effects of consortia against fungal pathogens.** (a) PDVA against *R. solani* (mycelia) whereby the isolates of the consortia are streaked out separately. (b) PDVA against fungal mycelia of *R. solani* by using consortia with mixed isolates. The same amount of liquid per isolate is used for combining the consortia.

As mentioned before, the consortia were assessed with PDVA and TCVA experiments to check the influence of volatiles on the growth of the pathogens. The 15 best performing consortia were selected for further analysis. The growth rates of *R. solani* were between 38% and 79% of the PDVA with the streaked consortia and between 74% and 97% of the PDVA with the mixed consortia. For the PDVA with the streaked consortia the best performing consortia was number 96 with an inhibition rate of 62% and for the second PDVA the consortia number 3 with an inhibition rate of 26%. The growth rates of the best performing consortia against the mycelia of *V. dahliae* were between 78% and 103%. Herein, even the consortium number 3 was the best performing with an inhibition rate of 22%. To determine the growth rate against the spores of *V. dahliae*, we prepared for this visual evaluation a scale from 12 (no inhibition; 100% growth) to 0 (maximum inhibition; 0% growth). Growth rates between 25% and 84% were observed. The best performing consortia were 110 and 163, the latter with an inhibition rate of 75% (Fig 8).



Figure 8: **Antagonistic effects of consortia against fungal pathogens.** (grey) PDVA against *R. solani* (mycelia) whereby the isolates of the consortia are streaked out separately. (azure) PDVA against fungal mycelia of *R. solani* by using consortia with mixed isolates. The same amount of liquid per isolate is used for combining the consortia. (green) TCVA against fungal mycelia of *V. dahliae* by using consortia with mixed isolates. (blue) PDVA against fungal spores of *V. dahliae* by using consortia with mixed isolates. The sample size was n=3.

Following the evaluation of the growth rate of the fungi through volatile interaction, a DCA was performed to check if the isolates fit together in vitro. Therefore, the isolates were streaked onto a Waksman agar plate including a fungal plaque of R. solani or a spore suspension of V. dahliae. If the bacteria were overgrown with the pathogenic fungus (#) the microorganisms of the consortia were classified as not compatible in vitro. If the Trichoderma isolate overgrew the whole plate (\*), the bacteria of the consortia supported this beneficial fungus against the pathogen. Some isolate came into contact with the pathogen (0), but were not killed through the pathogen or inhibited the pathogen. Other isolates of the consortia showed clear inhibition zones up to 10 mm (3) (Tab. 2). Through combining the results of the VOCs assays and the Dual culture assays, we selected consortia number 3, 9, 75, 96, 177 and 178 for further experiments. For the selection of the consortia we first focussed on the result of the VOCs assays. Furthermore, we wanted to increase the chance of getting positive results in further experiments. Therefore, we did not implement consortia 74 and 75 together, because they were of a too similar composition and displayed similar effects. Consortium 163 is a consortium composed of four of the worst isolates. It displayed positive antagonistic effects of volatiles, but the DCA approaches of this consortium showed negative influences between the isolates. Thus, we did not use this consortium for the next experiments. Considering that isolates which show negative influences to each other *in vitro*, could affect together positive *in vivo*, we keep the non-selected consortia as backup.

Table 2: **Dual culture assay of the consortia**. Example of the procedure of consortia combination. The isolates were streaked onto a Waksman agar plate including a fungal plaque of *R. solani* or a spore suspension of *V. dahliae*. Subsequent criteria were selected: # = bacteria are overgrown with the fungus; x = contaminated; 0 = come in contact with bacteria; 1 = 0-3 mm; 2 = 4-6mm; 3= >6 mm; \*=Trichoderma overgrew the plate.

Consortia		<i>R. solani</i> (mycelia	ı)	V. dahliae (spores)
	а	b	а	b
3	2/*/*/*	2/*/*/*	0/1/0/*	0/1/0/*
9	3/*/*/*	3/*/*/*	2/0/0/*	2/0/0/*
12	х	3/1/#/3	3/2/#/*	2/3/#*
16	3/1/*/*	*/1/*/*	2/2/2/*	3/2/2/*
49	#/2/0/2	#/2/0/1	#/2/2/0	#/2/2/0
56	#/2/2/#	#/2/2/#	#/2/2/#	#/2/3/#
74	2/2/#/1	1/1/#/2	3/0/2/2	3/0/2/2
75	2/1/#/1	2/1/#/1	3/0/0/2	3/0/0/2
84	2/2/2/0	2/2/1/0	3/0/0/2	3/0/0/2
94	3/*/*/*	3/3/2/3	3/1/0/3	3/1/0/3
96	*/*/*/*	*/*/*/*	2/*/0/3	2/*/0/3
110	0/2/2/#	0/1/2/#	2/2/0/0	2/1/0/0
163	2/0/#/1	2/0/#/2	3/0/#/1	3/0/#/1
177	3/0/0/1	3/0/0/1	3/0/0/1	2/0/0/1
178	3/0/0/1	3/0/0/1	3/0/0/1	3/0/0/1

### **3.2.4** Screening of consortia including a booster substance

In the first step, the boosters were prepared. Seven extracts were prepared from house compost, commercial bio compost, coffee ground, fresh horse dung, one-year-old horse dung, two-year-old horse dung and from potato shoots. For this approach,  $1 \text{ ml } dH_2O$  per

100 mg sample were filled in 50 ml falcon tubes. The extracts were sterilized in the autoclave at 121°C for 20 minutes, then centrifuged for 20 minutes at 5,000 g and sterilized through a filter 0.20  $\mu$ m. For the screening additional a commercial fertilizer and a bioactive alkyl-pyrazine (2-ethyl-pyrazine: 5-isobutyl-2,3-dimethylpyrazine; 1:1) were used. Subsequently, PDVA-based assessments against the mycelia of *R. solani* were conducted. Here, 1% of the extracts or commercial fertilizer were added to the consortia 3, 9, 75, 96, 177 and 178. For the alkyl-pyrazine, 0.3% was added to the consortium mix. After mixing the consortia with the boosters, the PDVA was prepared. For the consortia 3 and 9 no booster displayed a better effect *in vitro*. In contrast, the consortia 75, 96 and 178 increased their inhibition rate by the addition of pyrazine. Additionally, consortium 96 displayed better effects with bio-compost and commercial fertilizer as booster, and consortium 177 showed better inhibition by addition of bio-compost. The highest antagonistic effect was caused by adding pyrazine to consortium 75. The inhibition rate was increased for 15 percentage points (Fig 9).



Figure 9: Antagonistic effects of microbial consortia and consortia supplemented with different boosters against *R. solani* (mycelia). Consortia number 75, 96, 177 and 178 displayed higher inhibition rates by adding booster. The sample size was n=3

### 3.2.5 Narrowing the formulation by performing greenhouse trials

For the pre-greenhouse-trial the potato breed 'SOLO' was used and challenged with *V. dahl-iae.* Different formulations were used for the first assessments. We tested the consortia that included boosters and the consortia without boosters but with different compositions. For the approach of the four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer 1 ml in total, 250  $\mu$ l per isolate was used. In contrast, for the approach of the same number of cells per isolate were used, we counted the cells and adjusted them to the isolate with the lowest amounts of cells. As additional booster of *Trichoderma*, the fungus was incubated in coffee ground or millet for at least 22 days (Fig 10). These *Trichoderma* boosters were added in the same way as the Verticillium pathogen system. Five beads of millet overgrown with fungi were placed approximately 2 cm above the potato tuber. In the case of the coffee ground booster the size of the coffee ground added were the same as the millet beads. In addition to the synthetic consortia, we tested a natural consortium consisting of earthworm dung (Tab. 3).



Figure 10: **Preparation of a** *Trichoderma* **booster.** *T. gamsii* AT-1-2-4 was incubated on sterile millet for at least 22 days.

Table 3: Pre-greenhouse-trial – List of consortia including their formulation. Potato breed 'SOLO' was investigated against *V. dahliae*.

Consortia	Formulation
А	Control
В	Control + V. dahliae
с	Consortia 3 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + V. dahliae
D	Consortia 3 Same number of cells per isolate + V. dahliae
E	Consortia 3 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + coffee booster + V. dahliae
F	Consortia 3 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + millet booster + V. dahliae

G	Consortia 75 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + V. dahliae
н	Consortia 75 Same number of cells per isolate + <i>V. dahliae</i>
I	Consortia 75 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + pyrazine (0.3%) booster + V. dahliae
J	Consortia 96 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + V. dahliae
К	Consortia 96 Same number of cells per isolate + <i>V. dahliae</i>
L	Consortia 96 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + coffee booster + V. dahliae
Μ	Consortia 96 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + millet booster + V. dahliae
N	Consortia 177 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + V. dahliae
0	Consortia 177 Same number of cells per isolate + V. dahliae
Р	Consortia 177 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + bio-compost extract (1.0%) booster + <i>V. dahliae</i>
Q	Consortia 178 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + V. dahliae
R	Consortia 178 Same number of cells per isolate + V. dahliae
S	Consortia 178 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + pyrazine (0.3%) booster + V. dahliae
т	Vermi-compost (natural consortium) + V. dahliae

For the analysis of the pre-greenhouse-trials, the number of shoots was assessed and their length measured. Five pots for each consortium were planted. Interestingly, the potato plants that were not challenged with the pathogens showed lower amounts of shoots and a lower shoot length when compared to the potato plants with the pathogen. Thus, the total biomass of the infected potato plant was higher, than the biomass of the uninfected potato plant. The potato plants inoculated with consortia displayed different effects on the biomass. The highest amount of biomass was investigated following inoculation with a natural consortium. Only consortium 178, where the four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer were used for inoculation, had more shoots than the control infected with Verticillium. Consortium 3 including the coffee ground booster and consortium 177, when using the same number of cells per isolate, resulted in the same number of shoots. All other consortia formulations resulted in comparatively lower numbers (Fig. 11a). Consortia 3, 96 including the millet booster, consortia 75, 178 with the four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer used, consortium 96 with the same number of cells per isolate used and consortia 177, 178 including the boosters had longer shoots in average (Fig. 11b). In summary, for potatoes inoculated with the natural consortia the highest biomass was observed. In the case of the

synthetic consortia, even positive effects on biomass were investigated. Particularly, consortia including boosters and consortia combined with the four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer, displayed positive effects on biomass.



Figure 11: **Evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortia formulations against** *V. dahliae* **in the greenhouse.** *V. dahliae* was grown on millet beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'SOLO' was investigated for the interaction approach with the consortia for mulations. The sample size was n=5.

After harvesting the potato plantlets no direct correlation between positive effects on biomass (number of shoots, shoot length) and wilt disease or loss of shoots was observed, whereby a direct correlation of robustness of shoots and the wilt disease was found (Tab. 4). If the shoots were generally robust, no wilt disease was monitored. This effect was observed for consortium 75 with the four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer and consortium 96 including the coffee booster. For consortium 3 including the millet booster two plants out of five were robust, one plant displayed normal growth and two plants revealed wilt disease. It can be assumed that this consortium is unstable under the tested conditions. Thus consortium 3 was implemented in greenhouse trials against *R. solani*. Additionally, consortia 96 and 178 with four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer, consortia 75 and 178 including the pyrazine buffer and the natural consortia, no plant or only one plant revealed visual symptoms of wilt disease (Tab. 4). These consortia were additionally used for the subsequent greenhouse trial. Formulation K containing consortium 96 using the same number of cells per isolate was removed from further experiments, because treated potato shoots changed their colour to wine-red (Fig. 12).

Table 4: **Pre-greenhouse-trial – Consortia applied to potato tubers for protecting against** *V. dahliae.* Potato breed 'SOLO' was infected with *V. dahliae.* The number of plants displaying wilt disease or lost shoots, and robust plants were counted. The sample size was n=5.

Consortium	Wilt/Shoot Loss	Robustness
Α	0	0
В	3	0
С	2	0
D	3	0
E	4	1
F	2	2
G	0	3
н	4	0
I	0	0
J	1	0
К	1	0
L	0	3
м	3	0
N	3	0
0	2	1
Р	3	0
Q	1	1
R	1	0
S	0	0
т	0	0



Figure 12: Evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortium formulation K against V. dahliae in the greenhouse. The potato cultivar 'SOLO' was investigated for the interaction approach with the consortium formulation K. Potatoes inoculated with formulation K, containing consortium 96 using the same number of cells per isolate, displayed a wine-red colour.

### 3.2.6 Assessment of the formulations in greenhouse trials

For the pre-greenhouse-trial the potato breed 'Arkula' was used and challenged with *R. solani*. Arkula is known for being susceptible to *R. solani* infections. The best performing formulations of the first assessment were implemented in the second assessment. For the four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer 250  $\mu$ l inoculum per isolate was used (1 ml in total). As additional booster of *Trichoderma*, the fungus was incubated in coffee ground or millet for at least 22 days. Five beads of millet overgrown with fungi were placed approximately 2 cm above the potato tuber. In the case of the coffee ground booster, the size of the coffee ground added were the same as the millet beads. The pyrazine booster was added as a liquid to the consortia with the concentration of 0.3% v/v. In addition to the synthetic consortia, we tested a natural consortium consisting of earthworm dung (Tab. 5). The pathogen system of *R. solani* was prepared in analogy to the *Trichoderma* booster; however, barley grains were used instead of millet.

Table 5: **Pre-greenhouse-trial – List of consortia including their formulation**. Potato breed 'Arkula' was investigated against *R. solani*.

#### Consortia Formulation

Α	Control
В	Control + <i>R. solani</i>
F	Consortia 3 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + millet booster + R. solani
G	Consortia 75 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + <i>R. solani</i>
I	Consortia 75 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + pyrazine (0.3%) booster + <i>R</i> . <i>solani</i>
1	Consortia 96 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + <i>R. solani</i>
L	Consortia 96 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + coffee booster + R. solani
Q	Consortia 178 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + R. solani
S	Consortia 178 Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + pyrazine (0.3%) booster + <i>R</i> . <i>solani</i>
т	Vermi-compost (natural consortium) + R. solani

For the analysis of the pre-greenhouse-trials, the number of shoots was assessed and their length measured. Additionally, an infection factor was used for the evaluation, it ranged from the lowest (1) to the highest infection score (4) (Fig. 13).



Figure 13: **Evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortia formulations against R. solani on the potato tubers**. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was evaluated in terms of infection symptoms of the pathogen *R. solani* by using the lowest infection (1) to the highest infection score (4).

Six pots per consortium formulation were planted. Generally, the average number of shoots of the potato plants were in the range between four and six shoots per pot. Herein, no significant differences were observed (Fig. 14a). For the average length of the shoots, in the control containing the pathogen, the potatoes had the shortest shoots followed by the control without the pathogen. The potatoes inoculated with consortia had longer shoots than the controls, whereby the natural consortium resulted in the highest amount of biomass (Fig. 14b). In addition to the biomass the infection factor was investigated. Herein, no direct correlation between biomass and degree of infection was observed. The control without

the pathogen and consortium 178 with the four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer revealed the lowest number of symptoms of pathogen infection, followed by the natural consortium and consortium 75 containing the pyrazine booster. For all other consortia the same or a higher number of visible traits of the pathogen was observed (Fig. 14c).



Figure 14: **Evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortia formulation against R. solani in the greenhouse**. *R. solani* was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=6.

The evaluation of the infection factor provided indications that the pyrazine booster improved the effect of consortium 75 but impaired the effect of consortium 178 against *R. solani.* Therefore, consortia 75 and 178 were later evaluated on the field with and without the pyrazine booster respectively.

By obtaining these results, the first milestone to define four bacterial consortia with enhanced activity against potato pathogens and two prototype formulations was reached. Based on these results, we selected four formulations which we labelled as 'Patricia' (consortium 75), 'Lilly' (consortium 178) and Timi (consortium 96) (Tab. 6). In addition, we have identified four additional bacterial consortia and formulations with enhanced activity, which will serve as a backup.

Table 6: **Selected consortia including their prototype formulation**. Four consortia were assembled and include four microbial strains in each consortium.

Consortium	Microorganisms	Formulation
Patricia	Bacillus subtilis 1Pe4-13, Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-6, P. putida 6R5-24, Serratia fonticola 3Rc3	Consortium 75 with four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + pyrazine (0.3%) booster
Timi	Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-12, P. putida 6R5-24, Trichoderma gamsii AT 1-2-4, Trichoderma velutinum G1/8	Consortium 96 with four strains in phosphate buffer
Lilly	Pseudomonas chlororaphis L30-3-8, Pseudomonas chlororaphis 6R4-28, Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-6, Bacillus amyloliquefaciens Sc-K143	Consortium 178 with four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer
Lilly and Booster	Pseudomonas chlororaphis L30-3-8, Pseudomonas chlororaphis 6R4-28, Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-6, Bacillus amyloliquefaciens Sc-K143	Consortium 178 with four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + pyrazine (0.3%) booster

# **3.2.7** Selection of the formulation with the most suppressive effect against *R. solani* in the field.

The field experiment was performed at 'Leibniz-Institut für Gemüse- und Zierpflanzenbau (IGZEV)' in Großbeeren (Germany). The aim of this experiment was to identify the most promising formulation of microbial consortia that suppress the pathogen *R. solani* in combination with the potato cultivar 'Arkula'. Two microbial consortia were selected and applied either with or without the pyrazine-based booster on the field (Tab. 7).

Table 7: Microbial consortia including their prototype formulation for suppression of *R. solani* Ben3 on the field. Four formulations of microbial consortia were assembled. Each consortium includes four microbial strains.

Consortia	Microorganisms	Formulation
Patricia	Bacillus subtilis 1Pe4-13, Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-6, P. putida 6R5-24, Serratia fonticola 3Rc3	Consortium 75 - Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer

Patricia and booster	Bacillus subtilis 1Pe4-13, Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-6, P. putida 6R5-24, Serratia fonticola 3Rc3	Consortium 75 - Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + pyrazine (0.3%) booster
Lilly	Pseudomonas chlororaphis L3O-3-8, Pseudomonas chlororaphis 6R4-28, Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-6, Bacillus amyloliquefaciens Sc-K143	Consortium 178 - Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer
Lilly and booster	Pseudomonas chlororaphis L30-3-8, Pseudomonas chlororaphis 6R4-28, Pseudomonas corrugata 5Re4-6, Bacillus amyloliquefaciens Sc-K143	Consortium 178 - Four bacterial strains in phosphate buffer + pyrazine (0.3%) booster

A further aim of this experiment was to evaluate if the microbial consortia establish in the rhizosphere of the potato plants and if the pyrazine booster has an impact on the establishment of the bacteria. Therefore, rifampicin mutants (75  $\mu$ g/ml rifampicin) were constructed for the conducted field trial. Another important question addressed the impact of the microbial formulation on the plant associated microbiome. By using amplicon sequencing, shifts within the microbiome and potential recruitment of beneficial microbes via the microbial consortia can be investigated. Therefore, samples for a detailed microbiome analysis were obtained.

The field experiment was conducted in four stages: (i) planting and first treatment, (ii) second treatment, (iii) sampling for amplicon sequencing at flowering time and (iv) assessment at harvesting.

For the first treatment, potato tubers of the cultivar 'Arkula' were subjected to 11 different treatments (Tab. 8) and planted in a box parcel containing diluvial sand. The surface of potato tubers was spray-treated with the microbial consortia (108 CFU ml-1 per microorganism diluted in tap water) for all samples with microbial consortia containing 0.3% pyrazine booster or the pyrazine booster (0.3 % diluted in tap water) itself. After planting, the plants were exposed to 10 barley grains overgrown with *R. solani* per potato tuber (Tab. 8).

Table 8: **Treatment of the potato cultivar 'Arkula'.** The microbial consortia (108 CFU ml-1 per strain; <sup>+</sup>/. pyrazine booster 0.3%) were sprayed onto the surface of the potato tubers. Subsequently, 10 barley grains infected with *R. solani* Ben3 were added to the tubers. Subsequently, 10 barley grains infected with *R. solani* Ben3 were added to the tubers for targeted pathogen treatment.

Variant	Treatment
1	Arkula + <i>R. solani</i> Ben3
2	Arkula (non-treated)
3	Arkula + pyrazine booster
4	Arkula + consortium Patricia
5	Arkula + consortium Lilly
6	Arkula + consortium Patricia + pyrazine booster
7	Arkula + consortium Lilly + pyrazine booster
8	Arkula + consortium Patricia + <i>R. solani</i> Ben3
9	Arkula + consortium Lilly + <i>R. solani</i> Ben3
10	Arkula + consortium Patricia + pyrazine booster + <i>R. solani</i> Ben3
11	Arkula + consortium Lilly + pyrazine booster + <i>R. solani</i> Ben3

Before planting, the soil (diluvial sand) of the field was fertilized in order to reach 150 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> nitrogen and 300 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> potassium concentrations. The experiment was implemented in a randomized plot design. The size of one parcel was 2m x 2m, wherein 14 potato tubers were planted. The treatments were repeated four times (Tab. 9).

Table 9: **Randomized plot design of the field experiment.** In total, 11 potato tuber treatments (indicated by first number) were repeated randomly four times (indicated by second number) and planted on two fields (groups 1 and 2).

Group 1:										
1/1	3/1	5/1	7/1	9/1	11/1	2/2	5/2	4/2	10/2	11/2
2/1	4/1	6/1	8/1	10/1	1/2	3/2	6/2	8/2	7/2	9/2
Group 2:										
4/3	1/3	3/3	10/3	11/3	2/3	1/4	8/4	6/4	10/4	2/4
7/3	5/3	6/3	8/3	9/3	4/4	5/4	11/4	3⁄4	9/4	7/4

The second treatment was performed approximately 10 days after all potato shoots emerged. For this treatment, 100 ml of the formulations were applied per plant. Additionally, the shoot number was evaluated at this time. This assessment did not reveal significant differences in the number of shoots between treatments.

During the flowering stage, two potato plants per parcel were harvested for sampling of the DNA of the rhizosphere and for assessment of the aboveground biomass. Therefore, five grams of root biomass per plant were washed in a stomacher. One ml of the resulting suspension was plated on NA agar plates containing rifampicin (75  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup>) and cycloheximide (100  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup>) for evaluation of the establishment of the microbial consortia in the rhizosphere (Tab. 10). The residual suspension was centrifuged and the pellet was used for DNA extraction.

The strains of the applied microbial consortia were shown to be established in the rhizosphere. The number of the remaining, non-inoculum bacteria in the rhizosphere was calculated to be approximately 10<sup>4</sup> CFU ml<sup>-1</sup>. Even in the fields, containing the controls and the pyrazine booster itself, rifampicin mutants were observed. The detection of these mutants can be explained by the application of rifampicin mutants in former experiments (Tab. 10). The assessment of the aboveground biomass was included for the evaluation of the number of shoots, shoot length and the wet/dry weight of the aboveground biomass. Within this assessment, no significant differences between the treatments were observed.

Table 10: **Evaluation of the establishment of the microbial consortium strains in the rhizosphere.** In order to obtain insights in the establishment of the microbial consortia in the rhizosphere, rifampicin mutants (75  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup>) were constructed. Five grams of root biomass per plant were homogenized in a stomacher. One ml of the obtained suspension was plated on NA agar plates containing rifampicin (75  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup>) and cycloheximide (100  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup>). For assessment of the CFU ml<sup>-1</sup>, the colonies on the plates were counted.

Treatment number	Treatment	CFU ml <sup>-1</sup>
1	Control (+ <i>R. solani</i> AG-3)	4.50E + 01
2	Control (untreated)	1.10E + 02
3	Pyrazine booster	1.17E + 03
4	Patricia	9.30E + 04
5	Lilly	9.78E + 04
6	Patricia and Booster	4.93E + 04
7	Lilly and Booster	7.28E + 04

8	Patricia (+ <i>R. solani</i> AG-3)	7.49E + 04
9	Lilly (+ R. solani AG-3)	3.03E + 04
10	Patricia and Booster (+ <i>R. solani</i> AG-3)	6.56E + 04
11	Lilly and Booster (+ <i>R. solani</i> AG-3)	7.18E + 04

For the evaluation of the impact of the microbial formulation on the plant microbiome, the DNA of the potato rhizosphere was extracted. The DNA was used for detailed analyses of the microbial community (bacteria, fungi, oomycetes) via amplicon sequencing.

DNA was extracted from 270 mg of rhizosphere soil with the Qiagen PowerSoil kit according to the manufacturers' protocol. The extracted rhiozospheric DNA was used for amplicon library preparation of the V4 region from the 16S rRNA gene fragment and ITS1 region with a one-step PCR. For 16S rRNA amplification the universal primers 515F (5'-GTGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA-3') and 806R (5'-GGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT-3'), with sample-specific barcodes attached, were used. The PCR mix contained 1x Tag&Go, 0.2 mM of each primer and 1  $\mu$ l of the 1:10 diluted template and was performed in triplicates to each 30  $\mu$ l. PCR conditions were 96°C for 5 min, followed by 30 cycles of 96°C for 1 min, 54°C for 1 min and 74°C for 1 min, and a final elongation at 74°C for 10 min. Successful amplification was confirmed by gel electrophoresis on a 1% TAE gel. For amplification of the fungal ITS1 region the primer ITS1f (5'-CTTGGTCATTTAGAGGAAGTAA-3') and ITS2r (5'-GCTGCGTTCTTCATCGATGC-3') were used. The PCR mix and program was the same as for 16S rRNA amplification, except for the annealing temperature of 58°C. For analysis of the oomycetal community a two-step PCR protocol was applied. For the first step the primer ITSF Oo (5'-AGTATGYYTGTATCAGTG-3') and ITS4r (5'-TCCTCCGCTTATTGATATGC-3'), both attached with a primer pad, were used. The PCR mix contained 2 µl of Taq&Go, 1.2 µl of 25mM MgCl<sub>2</sub>, 0.1  $\mu$ l of each primer (10  $\mu$ M), 1  $\mu$ l of the template and 5.6  $\mu$ l water to reach a total volume of 10 µl. The PCR was performed in triplicates and PCR conditions were as followed: 95°C for 5 min, followed by 30 cycles of 95°C for 30s, 58°C for 35s and 72°C for 40s, and a final elongation at 72°C for 10 min. For the second step PCR, 1 µl ot the previous PCR was used as template and the PCR mix was the same as in the above described one step PCR protocol. The PCR conditions varied slightly, with an initial denaturation at 95°C for 5 min, followed by 15 cycles of 95°C for 30s, 53°C for 30s and 72°C for 30s, and a final elongation at 72°C for 5 min. All PCR products were purified, and equimolar amounts of the samples were pooled. The sequencing was performed by Eurofin on an Illumina MiSeq platform with 250 bp paired-end sequencing. The data was

analysed with Qiime2, R (version 4.2.2.) using Posit (Version 2022.12.0.353) with the packages phyloseq and vegan.

The amplicon sequencing resulted in 4,650,602, 1,272,380 and 319,180 reads, which were assigned to 9,829 bacterial, 5,537 fungal and 353 oomycetal ASVs, respectively.



Figure 15: Bacterial observed ASVs (A,C) and Shannon diversity (B,D).



Figure 16: Fungal observed ASVs (A,C) and Shannon diversity (B,D).
We observed a trend that the bacterial diversity in the treatments was lower compared to the water control, especially when stressed with *R. solani* (Fig. 15). This could result from the strong presence of the bacterial strains from the consortium, which we were able to proof with the rifamipicin mutants (Table 10). We performed Kruskal-Wallis statistics on the number of observed ASVs and Shannon diversity against the factor Treatment\*Pathogen (p=0.0076 and p=0.0006, respectively), followed by pairwise Wilcoxon test with p-value adjustment (fdr), which resulted in no significant differences. The fungal diversity in the treated samples showed a trend to increase when stressed with the pathogen compared to the water control.



Figure 17: Bacterial (A) and fungal (B) beta diversity obtained with a Bray-Curtis distance matrix.

Concerning the microbial community composition, we observed significant differences in the composition mainly between the treatments and to a lesser extent between the presence of a pathogen and/or the booster substance. PERMANOVA analysis showed that the treatment explained 12.7% (p=0.001) and 16.1% (p=0.001) of the bacterial and fungal community variation, respectively. The infection with the pathogen described only 3.2% (p=0.015) and 3.3% (p=0.013) of the bacterial and fungal community change, respectively. Addition of the booster substance had no significant influence on the bacterial community composition variation and with 3.2% (p=0.014) accounted only for minor part of the fungal community variation. In a NMDS and PCoA plot for the bacterial and fungal communities, respectively, these discrepancies could also be seen (Fig. 17).



Pseudomonadaceae Rhizobiaceae Rhodanobacteraceae Saccharimonadales Sphingobacteriaceae Sphingomonadaceae Streptomycetaceae Weeksellaceae Xanthobacteraceae Xanthomonadaceae

Figure 18: Bacterial taxonomic composition on family level.

In the bacterial dataset, *Proteobacteria* (72%) was the most abundant bacterial phylum, followed by *Bacteriodota* (19.7%) and *Actinobacteriota* (4.2%). On family level, differences between samples were observed: samples not stressed with a pathogen had higher levels of *Enterobacteriaceae* (16.1% compared to 7.5%), while the presence of the pathogen led to slightly increased abundance in *Pseudomonaceae* (12% compared to 9.7%) and *Rhodanobacteriaceae* (11.5% compared to 13%) (Fig. 18). *Pseudomonaceae* were also increased in the samples treated with the consortium and/or booster (11.2%) compared to the water control samples (8.7%), which could be explained by the presence of *Pseudomonas* sp. strains in the consortium.



Figure 19: Differentially abundant bacterial genera that were identified between the treatments, regardless of the presence of the pathogen.

*Streptomyces, Massilia* and *Kribbella* were enriched in the water and booster controls, while *Sphingobium* was enriched in the treatments (Fig. 19). Lilly with and without booster resulted in an enrichment of *Pseudoxanthomonas,* while this genus generally was more enriched in the treatments than in the control. *Devosia* and *Kribbella* were low abundant when only the bacterial consortium was applied.



Figure 20: Fungal community composition on family level.

For the fungal community, we identified *Ascomycota* (49.3%) as dominant phylum, while a substantial number of ASVs (30%) could not be assigned to a specific fungal phylum. In the control samples without pathogen, *Olpidiomycota* was more dominant (12.8%) than in the samples with pathogen (6.9%). Therefore, *Ascomycota* were slightly more abundant in the samples with pathogen (52.2% compared to 46.9%). On family level, the most prevalent hits were assigned to unidentified fungi, followed by the rare ones which were merged to "<1%" (14.3%) and *Nectriceae* (12.5%), which were more abundant in the samples treated with consortium and/or booster (13.2%) than in the untreated water controls (8.8%) (Fig. 20). The pathogen *R. solani* i spart of the family *Ceratobasidiaceae*, which did not belong to one of the more dominant fungal families, but they were a lot more abundant in the samples with pathogen (3.2%) than in the untreated control samples (0.7%). All samples, except for Paricia+Booster, showed lower abundance of the *Ceratobasidiaceae* than the water control.



Figure 21: Oomycetal taxonomic composition on genus level.

For the oomycetal community, the most abundant family in most samples were *Pythiaceae* (95%), followed by *Peronosporales* (4.4%). Only in the samples treated with Lilly+Booster and without the pathogen the *Peronosporales* were more dominant (52.3%) than *Pythiaceae* (46.6%). On genus level the most dominant groups were unidentified *Phyticaceae* (47%) and *Pythium* (43.6%) (Fig. 21).



Figure 22: Oomycetal shannon diversity (A) and observed ASVs (B).

The Shannon diversity and number of observed ASVs for the oomycetes community were both slightly higher in the water control samples, especially when artificially stressed with the pathogen (Fig. 22). We observed a moderate, positive correlation between the increase of the observed ASVs with the increase in bacterial diversity (r=0.49), when stressed with the pathogen. On the other hand, when no pathogen was present, the fungal observed ASVs (r=0.39) and Shannon diversity (r=0.49) positively correlated with an increase in bacterial diversity. Only minor positive correlation (r=0.28) was observed between ooymcetal Shannon diversity and bacterial diversity, when the pathogen is present. Interestingly, when not stressed with the pathogen, we detected a minor negative correlation between oomycetal and bacterial Shannon diversity (r=-0.29), which indicates that the oomycetal diversity increases when the bacterial diversity decreases.



Figure 23: Oomycetal beta diversity retrieved by Bray-Curtis distance matrix.

We observed a significant variation in the oomycetal community composition mainly between the treatments (12.2%, p=0.024) and no significant differences between the presence of the pathogen and/or the booster substance. Especially the clustering of the water control samples was evident when visualized in a NMDS plot (Fig. 23).

At harvesting time, the potato tubers were evaluated in terms of marketable and non-marketable tubers. Furthermore, the potato tubers were assessed concerning visible infections with *R. solani*, wherein the tubers were visually inspected for occurrence of sclerotia and the distinct symptoms of potato tubers, respectively. Additionally, the occurrence of scab disease on the tuber surface was assessed.

Concerning disease symptoms, the bacterial consortia were shown to significantly decrease the symptoms which are visible as dry cores and tuber deformation. The control group (untreated potato cultivar 'Arkula') infected with *R. solani* AG-3 was holistically infected with the pathogen. In contrast, the percentage of disease symptoms on the potato tubers treated with the consortium/booster combination ranged between 30% - 55%. The best results were observed after the inoculation of the potato tubers via the pure microbial consortia which substantially decreased the percentage of distinct disease symptoms in a range

between 5% and 20% (Fig. 24a). Even within the treatments without artificial pathogen infection, distinct disease symptoms decreased to a percentage of 5% to 15%. This is a reduction of 10% of the distinct symptoms compared to the respective control group (Fig. 24b).



Figure 24: **Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on the distinct symptoms caused by** *R*. *solani* **in the field.** *R. solani* was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the efficiency of the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=4.

The assessment of sclerotia formation and scab disease occurrence on potato tubers revealed the same positive effects of the bacterial formulations as the assessment of the distinct disease symptoms displayed. For the assessment, tubers were grouped in terms of very low infection (0.0% - 0.9%), low infection (1.0% - 4.9%), high infection (5.0 - 9.9%) and very high infection (more than 10%); the percentage describes the proportion of the tuber surface that was affected. Concerning the sclerotia infestation, the percentage of potato tubers revealing very low infestation of sclerotia substantially increased. Compared to the control group exposed to the pathogen, treatment with the consortium 'Patricia' resulted in approximately 60% more potato tubers featuring very low infection rates, followed by consortium 'Lilly' (45%), 'Patricia + Booster' (40%) and 'Lilly + Booster' (38%) (Fig. 25a). A reduced incidence of sclerotia was even observed after the application of the bacterial formulation in the treatments without artificial infection with *R. solani* AG-3. Herein, the percentage of very low infection compared to the control increased in a range from 10% ('Pyrazine Booster', 'Patricia', 'Lilly and Booster') to 20% ('Lilly', 'Patricia and Booster') (Fig. 25b).



Figure 25: Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on the sclerotia infestation caused by *R*. *solani* in the field. *R. solani* was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=4. ANOVA analysis: p-value (<0.05; p.adjustment.method = "fdr").

For the assessment of scab disease on the tuber surface of potatoes the same categories were used as for the assessment of sclerotia infestation. In the treatments containing the pathogen *R. solani* AG-3 a decrease of scab disease was observed. Compared to the control containing only the pathogen, the consortia 'Patricia' and 'Lilly' increased the "very low infection" group to 20%. The treatments containing the pyrazine booster improved the percentage of very low infection to 5% - 10% (Fig. 26a). The positive effects of the bacterial formulations in terms of scab disease incidence were higher in the treatments without artificial infection with *R. solani* AG-3. Compared to the control, the percentage of "very low" infection was improved from 40% ('Patricia', 'Lilly', 'Patricia and Booster') to 15% ('Pyrazine Booster') and 5% ('Lilly and Booster') (Fig. 26b).



Figure 26: **Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on scab disease in the field.** *R. solani* was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=4. ANOVA analysis: p-value (<0.05; p.adjustment.method = "fdr").

Furthermore, the weight of the marketable tubers was assessed. In total, 12 plants per block were harvested and their weight of potato tubers evaluated. The weight of the tubers of all treatments ranged between 9,000 g and 10,000 g. The marketable tubers were assessed by categorizing them in terms of size (30 mm - 60 mm), distinct disease symptoms (no visible symptoms required), sclerotia infestation and scab disease (max. 1% infection of the tuber surface). Compared to the control group that was exposed to the pathogen, the bacterial consortium 'Patricia' revealed the highest yield of marketable tubers with approximately

6,200 grams, followed by 'Lilly' (5,000 g) and the formulations containing the pyrazine booster (3,000 g) (Fig. 27).



Figure 27: **Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on the weight of marketable tubers in the field**. *R. solani* was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=4.

Additionally, the weight of marketable tubers was separated in two different categories. The tubers of category one did not show any disease symptoms. In contrast, the tubers of category two were affected by sclerotia infestation and scab disease of max. 1% of the tuber surface. The control exposed to the pathogen did not yield any potato tubers of category one. Contrary, the bacterial consortia 'Patricia' (1,600 g) and 'Lilly' (1,100 g) yielded more marketable tuber of category one than the control without artificial infection with the pathogen (700 g). The formulations containing the pyrazine booster resulted in lower yields ('Patricia and Booster', 700 g; 'Lilly and Booster', 300 g) than the bacterial consortia (Fig. 28).



Figure 28: **Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on the weight of marketable tubers of different tuber categories in the field**. *R. solani* was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato tubers of all treatments, except the control, were infected with *R. solani*. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=4. ANOVA analysis: p-value (<0.05; p.adjustment.method = "fdr").

Overall, significant positive effects were observed when the designed bacterial consortia were applied. However, the pyrazine booster did not improve the effect of the bacterial consortia. Therefore, new booster formulations must be assessed during the next months.

#### 3.2.8 Evaluation of formulation efficiency with different potato genotypes

The aim of this experiment was to identify the most fitting potato genotypes, which showed the best interaction effects with the beneficial microbial consortia against *R. solani*, out of the eleven that were preselected by the international project partners. The experiments were conducted with the same soil as used by the PotatoMetaBiome project partner in Munich in order to increase the comparability. Furthermore, the interactions of the plant-associated microbiome will be evaluated in the frame of this experiment. Therefore, the required pots were filled with soil (delivered from Bavaria) and watered for one week. After one week the plantlets were planted into the pots. The plantlets were acclimatized for two weeks via addition of more water than the water holding capacity (WHC) of 60%. After acclimatization, the soil is adjusted to the WHC 60% and the plantlets via infection with the pathogen was conducted. In the treatment groups, the plantlets were inoculated with the beneficial consortia. In the seventh week, leaves were harvested for the detection of plant volatiles and sent to the partner MPI in Potsdam. The final harvesting was conducted

in week eight; here, the DNA sampling of the rhizosphere and further amplicon sequencing will be conducted. Additionally, the biomass was evaluated, and the roots were sampled and sent to the partner UPPA in Pau for detection of endophytes (Fig. 29).



Figure 29: Experimental design for the selection of 11 potato genotypes and the evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortia formulations against *R. solani* in the greenhouse. *R. solani* was grown on barley grains for at least 22 days. In total, 11 different genotypes of potato plantlets were evaluated in the frame of the interaction approach with the consortia formulations in soil (WHC 60%).

The designed microbial consortia, containing the pyrazine booster, revealed negative interactions with the potato plantlets (Fig. 30). Therefore, the greenhouse experiment was not successful and will be repeated with the already tested microbial consortia in combination with new boosters.



Figure 30: **Evaluation of formulation efficiency with different potato genotypes against** *R. solani* **in the greenhouse**. *R. solani* was grown on barley grains for at least 22 days. In total, 11 different genotypes of potato plantlets were evaluated in the frame of the interaction approach with the consortia formulations in soil (WHC 60%).

# **3.2.9** Targeted screening for boosters for the beneficial consortium 'Patricia'

The microbial consortium 'Patricia' was identified as the best performing one, therefore booster substances that improve the beneficial effect of the consortium against the pathogens *R. solani* AG-3 and *V. dahliae* ELV-16 were specifically searched for this consortium. In total, 109 substances were screened in terms of their improvement of antifungal traits of the bacterial consortium 'Patricia' (Fig. 31).

1	Dodecane	41	vanthine	81	3.5 Dinitrosalicylic acid
2	Pentamethylhentane	42	I-valine	82	L-Tartaric acid
3	Linalool	43	Horse dung (fresh)	83	Caprylic acid
4	Phenoxyethylacetate	44	Harnstoff	84	Pelargonic acid
5	Bisabolene	45	Horse dung (>2 years)	85	2-Undecanone
6	BioTrissol	46	Hauskompost commercial	86	Lauric acid
7	Casamino acid	47	L-arabinose	87	Myristic acid
8	Fe3Fertilizer	48	D-Eurose	88	Palmitic acid
9	PDA	49	D-Fructose	89	Arachidic acid
10	GIC 40%	50	D-Galactomannan	90	Tridecanol
11	Gal 20%	51	Lactose monohydrate	91	2.3 butanediol
12	Substral	52	Maltose	92	S-methyl-cysteine
13	Mix 6/8/12	53	D-Mannose	93	Acetic acid
14	Coffee ground	54	D-Ribose	94	Methoxyacetate
15	House compost	55	D-Mannit	95	Acetone
16	T/Pentone	56	Melitose	96	2-methyl-1-hutanol
17	Shoot extract	57	Octadecane	97	3-methyl-1-hutanol
18	L-asparginic acid	58	L-Rhamnose monohydrate	98	2-butanone
19	y-aminobutyric acid	59	D-Xylose	99	Artificial root exudate
20	L-cysteiniumchloride	60	Trehalose	100	Citrate
21	L-asparagine	61	D-Sorbit	101	1-Decanol
22	L-aspartic acid	62	D-Saccharose	102	D-Pantothenic acid Calcium salt
23	L-cysteine	63	Caproic acid	103	1-Dodecanol
24	L-citruline	64	Cholesterin	104	Valeric acid
25	3,4-dihydroxy-L-phenylalanine	65	Capric acid	105	Fumaric acid
26	Dicarboxybenzoyl-L-arginine	66	p-coumaric acid	106	Lactic acid
27	L-glutamic acid	67	Chitin	107	L-alanine, (S)-2-Aminopropansäure
28	L-glutamine	68	Caffeine	108	L-argenine
29	L-histidine	69	Citric acid	109	1-Butanol
30	L-isoleucine	70	Malonic acid		
31	Inosine	71	Maleic acid		
32	L-lysine monohydrate	72	Diethyl-oxalacetate		
33	L-leucine	73	4-Hydroxybenzoesäure		
34	L-methionine	74	Eisen(III)sulfide		
35	L-phenylalanine	75	6-aminocaproic acid		
36	L-tryptophane	76	Proprionsäureamid		
37	L-proline	77	ß-alanine	_	
38	L-threonine	78	L-malic acid	_	
39	L-tyrosine	79	Benzoic acid	_	
40	L-serine	80	Succinic anhydride	_	

Figure 31: List of potential 'booster' substances that were screened for improvement of the traits of the bacterial consortium 'Patricia'.

In the first step, the improvement of the production of antifungal volatiles was assessed with a PDVA against *R. solani* AG-3. For this purpose, the boosting substances were either diluted with water or DMSO, sterilized through a filter (0.20  $\mu$ m) and added to the NA agar. Additionally, the best performing boosters were assessed via a contact-based dual-culture assay containing the boosting substances on WAKSMAN agar. The aim of the assessment with the Dual Culture Assay was the exclusion of potentially growth-enhancing effects of the substance on the fungal pathogens *R. solani* AG-3 and *V. dahliae* ELV-16. By integration of the results of both assays, the best performing substances were identified as Lauric acid (14 mM), 2-methyl-1-butanol (0.5% v/v), D-Pantothenic acid Calcium salt (25 mM), Octadecane (0.5% v/v) and Palmitic acid (25 mM) (Fig. 32).

PDVA assessments revealed additional inhibition rates of the fungal mycelia of *R. solani* AG-3 by Lauric acid (18%), 2-methyl-1-butanol (30%), D-Pantothenic acid Calcium salt (21%), Octadecane (28%) and Palmitic acid (32%). In addition, controls were included to assess potential antifungal effects by the substances itself (Fig. 32).



Figure 32: Antagonistic effects of the microbial consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with different boosters against R. solani (mycelia). The five best performing substances for boosting antifungal traits of the bacterial consortium are shown. The sample size was n=6.

Compared to the control group, the bacterial consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with the booster substances revealed an increased inhibition zone against both pathogens. The best performing substance in the Dual Culture Assay was Lauric acid followed by Octadecane, 2-methyl-1-butanol, Palmitic acid and D-Pantothenic acid Calcium salt (Fig. 32).



Figure 33: Antagonistic effects of microbial consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with different boosters against *R. solani* and *V. dahliae* (mycelia). The five best performing substances for boosting antifungal traits of the bacterial consortium are shown. Dual Culture Assay against *V. dahliae* (left) and *R. solani* (right). The sample size was n=3.

Combinations of these five substances were investigated, but indicated decreasing inhibition rates or even negative effects when compared to the application of pure substances.

In addition, a preliminary greenhouse experiment was performed to observe the effect of the formulation on plant fitness. The tomato breed 'Salattomate' (Hornbach Baumarkt AG, Germany) was inoculated with 20 ml of the formulation containing the consortium 'Patricia' (1\*108 CFU ml<sup>-1</sup>) and the boosting substances Lauric acid (14 mM), 2-methyl-1-butanol (0.5% v/v), D-Pantothenic acid Calcium salt (25 mM), Octadecane (0.5% v/v) and Palmitic acid (25 mM). The experiment was stopped after three weeks. Tomato plants were used instead of potato plants to obtained distinct results in a short time period with a plant from the same plant family. Only consortium 'Patricia' containing the volatile compound 2-methyl-1-butanol showed a good compatibility with the plant. Other tomato plants which were inoculated with the formulations containing Panthothenic acid calcium salt, Octadecane, Palmitic acid, or Lauric acid died within one week (Fig. 34).



Patricia



2-methyl-1-butanol



Palmitic acid



Pantothenic acid Calcium salt



#### Octadecane



Lauric acid

Figure 34: **Observable effects of the microbial consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with different boosters on the fitness of tomato plants**. Inocula of 20 ml with the five best performing formulations containing substances for boosting antifungal traits of the bacterial consortium were inoculated to the tomato breed 'Salattomate'. (Green boxes) Positive performing formulations. (Red boxes) Negative performing formulations. The sample size was n=6.

Due to these observations, the formulation containing consortium 'Patricia' and 2-methyl-1-butanol was selected for further greenhouse experiments.

#### **3.2.10** Effect of the beneficial consortium 'Patricia' containing 2-methyl-1butanol on the plant's life cycle

The potato breed 'Desiree' was inoculated with the newly constructed formulation containing consortium 'Patricia' mixed with the volatile 2-methyl-1-butanol (0.5 % v/v). The aim was to observe phenotypic differences of the plant as well as the rhizosphere microbiome during different life cycles of the potato plant. Pots with a volume of 10 L were filled with a composite of 80 % Einheitserde Profisubstrat Classic (Balster Einheitserdewerke GmbH, Germany) and 20 % Flairstone Estrichsand 0 – 4 mm (Hornbach Baumarkt AG, Germany). The potato tubers of the breed 'Desiree' were spray-treated with the formulation containing consortium 'Patricia' with a concentration of  $10^8$  CFU ml<sup>-1</sup> per isolate and 2-methyl-1butanol (0.5 % v/v) and planted into the pot with a depth of 10 cm. Further, ten barley grains infected with *R. solani* AG-3 were directly added to the potato tubers. A second treatment was conducted when the shoots of all plants were visible. For the second treatment, 100 ml of the formulation per plant or water (negative control) were poured to the pots. The assessment of plant growth and rhizosphere sampling were performed at four different timepoints (T1: Sprouting; T2: Development of tubers; T3: Flowering; T4: Ripening) (Fig. 35).



Figure 35: Four timepoints that were analysed during the life cycle of the potato plant. The potato breed 'Desiree' was inoculated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. Sampling was performed at four different timepoints. Plants implemented as negative controls were supplemented with tap water. The sample size was n=6.

The potato plants treated with the formulation completed their life cycle stags faster when compared to the plants treated with water. At timepoint three 'Flowering' 59% of the plants treated with the formulation were flowering, for 33% of the plants no flower was observed for that timepoint and 8% of the plants were so heavily damaged or stressed that they have been harvested. For the plants treated with water only 33% were flowering, 42% were not flowering and the plants which were heavily damaged by the pathogen increased to 25% (Fig. 36).



Figure 36: **Assessment of potato plants at the flowering development stage.** The plants of the potato breed 'Desiree' treated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol were earlier flowering and less stressed compared to the plants treated with water. The sample size was n=12.

In addition, the untreated plants showed more stress symptoms compared to the treated ones (Fig. 37). Between timepoint two 'Development of tuber' and timepoint three 'Flowering' the day temperature in the greenhouse reached up to 40°C in average. During this time, a positive influence against heat stress of the formulation on the plants was observed.



Water



### Formulation

Figure 37: **Potato breed 'Desiree' between timepoint two 'Development of tuber' and timepoint three 'Flowering'.** The plants of the potato breed 'Desiree' treated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol showed higher resilience to heat stress compared to the plants treated with water. The formulation increased the length of the shoots between the 'Development of tuber' (T2 = Timepoint) and 'Flowering' (T3) (Fig. 38). However, at 'Ripening' (T4) no difference in the length of the potato shoots was observed. Furthermore, there was no difference in the length of the roots between both treatments. At 'Ripening' (T4) the number of tubers, the weight of tubers and the disease symptoms of *R. solani* were assessed. The number of tubers were not differing between the treated and untreated tubers. Additionally, sclerotia infestation was not observed. The potato plants treated with the formulation produced higher tuber weights and the tubers had a lower percentage of the distinct disease symptoms (tuber deformation, dry core) (Fig. 39).



Figure 38: **Assessment of the length of shoots of potato breed 'Desiree' at different life cycle timepoints.** The plants of the potato breed 'Desiree' were treated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2methyl-1-butanol and water. The plants were infected with *R. solani* AG-3. (a) Shoot length at 'Development of tuber'. (b) Shoot length at 'Flowering'. The sample size was n=6.



Figure 39: **Assessment of disease symptoms in potato breed 'Desiree' at 'Ripening'.** The plants of the potato breed 'Desiree' were treated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol and water. In parallel, the plants were exposed to the pathogen *R. solani* AG-3. (a) Weight of tubers in gram. (b) Percentage of the distinct disease symptoms. The sample size was n=6.

Additionally, to the assessment of plant parameters, the microbial community of the rhizosphere was determined at the four sampling time points. DNA extraction and 16S rRNA and ITS library preparation were performed as described in chapter 3.2.7.





The amplicon sequencing approach resulted in 3,168,555 and 1,290,149 high-quality reads, which were assigned to 9,722 bacterial and 2,014 fungal ASVs, respectively. Generally, there were several observable differences in the bacterial diversity between the plants treated with formulation and the untreated water control. While for the formulation both, Shannon diversity and observed ASVs, gradually increased, the diversity in the water control treatment stayed unchanged for the first three sampling timepoints (Fig. 41). Only for the last

sampling time point "Ripening", a strong increase in diversity was observed (Fig. 41C). Except for the shannon diversity at time point "Sprouting" the formulation showed similar or higher diversity compared to the water control. The sharp rise in diversity for the control between "Flowering" and "Ripening" could result from the heat stress in the glasshouse. It was previously described that abiotic stress can lead to a short-term increase of diversity, while in the long run the diversty decreases (Berg and Cernava 2022).



Figure 41: **Fungal alpha diversity depicted as observed (A, C) and shannon (B, D) diversity.** Kruskal-Wallis test was applied, followed by pairwise Wilcoxon test with "fdr" as p-value adjustment. The sample size was n=6.

Similar results were detected for the fungal diversity. Plants treated with formulation yielded similar or higher number of ASVs compared to the control (Fig. 42A). Shannon diversity showed no significant result, yet the treated samples had always similar or higher diversity compared to the control (Fig. 42B).



Figure 42: Bacterial beta diversity obtained from a Bray-Curtis distance matrix displayed as NMDS plot.



Figure 43: Fungal community composition resulting from Bray-Curtis distance matrix (A) and with exclusion of two outliers (B).

In addition to the microbial diversity, we observed significant differences in the microbial composition between the treatments and harvest time points for both bacterial (treatment: R<sup>2</sup>=0.115, p=0.001, harvest: R<sup>2</sup>=0.157, p=0.001 and treatment\*harvest: R<sup>2</sup>=0.109, p=0.001) and fungal (treatment: R<sup>2</sup>=0.205, p=0.001, harvest: R<sup>2</sup>=0.097, p=0.015 and treatment\*harvest: R<sup>2</sup>=0.111, p=0.004) communities. The adonis-based comparisons of the microbial communities revealed that the bacterial community is stronger influenced by the sampling time than by the treatment. In contrast for the fungal community, we observed a stronger influence of the treatment than the sampling time point. These differences were also observable in a NMDS and PCoA plot for bacterial and fungal communities, respectively (Fig 43, 44). Especially for the bacterial community composition the treated samples form a very narrow cluster, and the untreated ones are more scattered and diffused. Interestingly, the water control samples from the last sampling time point tend to cluster with the formulation treated samples. For the fungal community a similar pattern was observed. Again, the treated samples form a confined cluster, while the untreated samples are more dispersed and the control samples from the last sampling time point group with the formulation samples.



Figure 44: Bacterial taxonomic composition on family level.

Actinobacteria was the dominating phylum (54.5%), followed by Proteobacteria (22.5%), and together they made up almost 80% of the relative abundance. On family level Strepto-

*mycetaceae* was the most abundant taxon (43.6%), followed by the ASVs with low abundance below 1% (Fig. 45). However, the abundance of the *Streptomyceae* varied and increased over time, especially for the formulation treated samples.



Figure 45: Fungal taxonomic composition on family level.

The fungal dataset was dominated by *Ascomycota* with a relative abundance of 96.3%. On family level the *Pseudoeurotiaceae* (56.3%) were the most abundant group, followed by the *Hypocreaceae* (13.8%) (Fig. 46). The water control showed higher abundance of *Aspergillaceae* (5.3%) than the formulation treated samples (2.3%).

### 3.2.11 Effect of the beneficial consortium 'Patricia' containing 2-methyl-1butanol on different potato genotypes

Due to the fact that the first greenhouse experiment, in which the formulation efficiency with different potato genotypes had to be evaluated, was not successful, a second greenhouse experiment was conducted during summer 2021. The aim of this experiment was to identify the most fitting potato genotypes, which showed the best interaction effects with the beneficial microbial consortia against *R. solani* and *V. dahliae*, out of the eleven that were preselected by the international project partners. The experiments were conducted with the same soil as used by the project partner in Munich in order to increase the comparability. Planting pots were filled with soil (delivered from Bavaria) and watered for one

week. After one week the plantlets were planted into the pots. The plantlets were acclimatized for two weeks via addition of more water than the specific water holding capacity (WHC) of 60%. After acclimatization, the aim was to adjust the soil to the WHC 60% and to grow the plantlets for three additional weeks. As the greenhouse was not air-conditioned, it was not possible to keep the WHC at 60%. In the fifth week, the stress induction of the plantlets via infection with the pathogen was conducted. In the treatment groups, the plantlets were inoculated with the beneficial consortia. In the seventh week, leaves were harvested for the detection of plant volatiles and sent to the partner MPI in Potsdam. The final harvesting was conducted in week eight; here, the DNA sampling of the rhizosphere and further amplicon sequencing will be conducted. Additionally, the biomass was evaluated and the roots were sampled and sent to the partner UPPA in Pau for detection of endophytes.

The assessment of the effect of the beneficial consortia resulted in genotype specific effects. Differences in the number of tubers after infection with *V. dahliae* were observed for the genotypes 'Atol' and 'Krab'. Consortia 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol (booster) increased the number of tubers, whereby the contrary effect of this formulation was observed for the genotype 'Krab' (Fig. 47). Furthermore, consortium 'Patricia' decreased the growth of the shoots of potato breed 'Bihoro' (Fig. 48). The same effect of consortium 'Patricia' was observed for the length of the roots of potato breed 'Rudawa'. Consortium 'Patricia' decreased the length of the roots, but if the consortium was supplemented with the boosting substance the growth of the roots increased (Fig. 49).



Figure 46: **Assessment of the tuber number of potato breed 'Atol' and 'Krab' after infection with the pathogen** *V. dahliae* **ELV16**. The plantlets were treated with water, consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. (a) Potato breed 'Atol'. (b) Potato breed 'Krab'. The sample size was n=8.



Figure 47: **Assessment of the length of shoots of potato breed 'Bihoro' after infection with the pathogen** *V. dahliae* **ELV16**. The plantlets were treated with water, consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. The sample size was n=8.



Figure 48: **Assessment of the length of the roots of potato breed 'Rudawa' after infection with the pathogen** *V. dahlia* **ELV16**. The plantlets were treated with water, consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. The sample size was n=8.

For the assessment of the effects of the formulation on the genotypes after infection with *R. solani*, different genotypes were shown to be differentially affected compared to the experiment with the pathogen *V. dahliae*. The growth of the shoots of potato breed 'Brda Stara' and 'Desiree' increased after inoculation with consortium 'Patricia' (Fig. 50).



Figure 49: Assessment of the length of the potato shoots of breed 'Brda Stara' and 'Desiree' after infection with the pathogen *R. solani* AG-3. The plantlets were treated with water, consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1- butanol. (a) Potato breed 'Brda Stara'. (b) Potato breed 'Desiree'. The sample size was n=8.

Furthermore, the shoot weight of potato breed 'Pasja Pomorska' (Fig. 51) and the dry weight of the shoot of potato breed 'Salto' (Fig. 52) decreased after the application of consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol.



Figure 50: Assessment of the weight of the shoots of potato breed 'Pasja Pomorska' after infection with the pathogen *R. solani* AG-3. The plantlets were treated with water, consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. The sample size was n=8.



Figure 51: **Assessment of the dry weight of the shoots of potato breed 'Salto' after infection with the pathogen** *R. solani* **AG-3**. The plantlets were treated with water, consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. The sample size was n=8.

Since the formulation did not significantly improve the shoot growth of several potato cultivars, it was decided to analyse the microbiome composition of the rhizosphere from the field trial, descibed in chapter 3.2.7, instead.

## **3.2.12 Effect of 2-methyl-1-butanol on the production of volatiles on the beneficial consortium 'Patricia'**

A gas chromatography – solid phase mass spectrometry (GC-MS) headspace analysis was performed to detect volatiles produced by the bacterial consortium 'Patricia'. The aim of this experiment was the detection of volatiles which are produced or consumed by the consortium after the supplementation of the boosting substance 2-methyl-1-butanol. For the preparation of the GC-MS analysis the consortium was streaked either on Nutrition Broth II agar or on Nutrition Broth II agar containing 2-methyl-1-butanol (0.5% v/v). 2-methyl-1-butanol increased the production of '1-butanol, 2-methyl, acetate', '1-Butanol, 2-methyl-, propanoate', 'Propanoic acid, 2-methyl-, 2-methylbutyl ester', 'Butanoic acid, 2-methyl-, 2-methylbutyl ester' and the consumption of 'Dimethyl trisulfide' of the consortium 'Patricia'. 'Butanoic acid, 2-methylbutyl ester' was
only produced by consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with the boosting substance. In contrast, 1-Undecene was only produced by consortium 'Patricia' itself. Benzaldehyde was consumed via both formulations in the same amounts.

Table 11: **Evaluation of the boosting effect of volatile production by consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol**. In order to obtain insights in the volatile production or consumption through the formulations a GC-MS headspace measurement was performed. 50  $\mu$ l of the bacterial consortium with an OD600 of 0.8 were streaked either on Nutrition Broth II agar or Nutrition Broth II agar containing 2-methyl-1-butanol (0.5% v/v).

Volatile	Patricia	Patricia and Booster
1-butanol, 2-methyl, acetate	Constant production	Production increased
Benzaldehyde	Consumption	Consumption
Dimethyl trisulfide	Consumption	Consumption increased
1-Butanol, 2-methyl-, propanoate	Constant production	Production increased
Propanoic acid, 2-methyl-, 2-methylbutyl ester	Constant production	Production increased
Butanoic acid, 2-methylbutyl ester	Not produced	New production
1-Undecene	New production	Not produced
Butanoic acid, 2-methyl-, 2-methylbutyl ester	New production	Production increased
Butanoic acid, 3-methyl-, 2-methylbutyl ester	New production	Production increased

#### Tabellenverzeichnis

Table 1: Example of the procedure that was implemented for consortia combinations. The aim was to construct the consortia based on the best performing isolates in the five Table 2: Dual culture assay of the consortia. Example of the procedure of consortia combination. The isolates were streaked onto a Waksman agar plate including a fungal plaque of *R. solani* or a spore suspension of *V. dahliae*. Subsequent criteria were selected: # = bacteria are overgrown with the fungus; x = contaminated; 0 = come in contact with Table 3: Pre-greenhouse-trial – List of consortia including their formulation. Potato breed Table 4: Pre-greenhouse-trial – Consortia applied to potato tubers for protecting against V. dahliae. Potato breed 'SOLO' was infected with V. dahliae. The number of plants displaying wilt disease or lost shoots, and robust plants were counted. The sample size Table 5: Pre-greenhouse-trial – List of consortia including their formulation. Potato breed Table 6: Selected consortia including their prototype formulation. Four consortia were Table 7: Microbial consortia including their prototype formulation for suppression of R. solani Ben3 on the field. Four formulations of microbial consortia were assembled. Each Table 8: Treatment of the potato cultivar 'Arkula'. The microbial consortia (108 CFU ml-1 per strain; +/\_ pyrazine booster 0.3%) were sprayed onto the surface of the potato tubers. Subsequently, 10 barley grains infected with *R. solani* Ben3 were added to the tubers. Subsequently, 10 barley grains infected with R. solani Ben3 were added to the tubers for Table 9: Randomized plot design of the field experiment. In total, 11 potato tuber treatments (indicated by first number) were repeated randomly four times (indicated by Table 10: Evaluation of the establishment of the microbial consortium strains in the rhizosphere. In order to obtain insights in the establishment of the microbial consortia in the rhizosphere, rifampicin mutants (75  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup>) were constructed. Five grams of root biomass per plant were homogenized in a stomacher. One ml of the obtained suspension was plated on NA agar plates containing rifampicin (75  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup>) and cycloheximide (100  $\mu$ g  

### Abbildungsverzeichnis

Figure 4: Antagonistic effect of the volatiles of the 25 best performing isolates against fungal pathogens. (a) PDVA against V. dahliae (spores). The inhibition grade was visually measured after six days of incubation. 5,000 fungal spores per assay were applied. The assay was performed in triplicates. (b) Visuable inhibition grade from 'C' control, '0' no inhibition to '3' very high inhibition. The Inhibition grade 4 for one isolate shows no fungal growth. The sum of the three results per isolate reveals the inhibition grade (maximum Figure 5: List of consortia including the isolate numbers that were included in the four-Figure 6: The assays used for investigating antagonistic effects of consortia against fungal pathogens. (a) TCVA against V. dahliae (mycelia). (b) PDVA against fungal mycelia of R. solani and spores of V. dahliae. (c) DCA against fungal mycelia of R. solani. (d) DCA against fungal spores of V. dahliae......19 Figure 7: Antagonistic effects of consortia against fungal pathogens. (a) PDVA against R. solani (mycelia) whereby the isolates of the consortia are streaked out separately. (b) PDVA against fungal mycelia of *R. solani* by using consortia with mixed isolates. The same Figure 8: Antagonistic effects of consortia against fungal pathogens. (grey) PDVA against *R. solani* (mycelia) whereby the isolates of the consortia are streaked out separately. (azure) PDVA against fungal mycelia of *R. solani* by using consortia with mixed isolates. The same amount of liquid per isolate is used for combining the consortia. (green) TCVA

against fungal mycelia of <i>V. dahliae</i> by using consortia with mixed isolates. (blue) PDVA
against fungal spores of <i>V. dahliae</i> by using consortia with mixed isolates. The growth rate
of the fungal mycelia or spores is shown. The sample size was n=3
Figure 9: Antagonistic effects of microbial consortia and consortia supplemented with
different boosters against R. solani (mycelia). Consortia number 75, 96, 177 and 178
displayed higher inhibition rates by adding booster. The sample size was n=3
Figure 10: Preparation of a Trichoderma booster. T. gamsii AT-1-2-4 was incubated on
sterile millet for at least 22 days
Figure 11: Evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortia formulations against V. dahliae
in the greenhouse. V. dahliae was grown on millet beads for at least 22 days. The potato
cultivar 'SOLO' was investigated for the interaction approach with the consortia for
mulations. The sample size was n=5
Figure 12: Evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortium formulation K against V.
dahliae in the greenhouse. The potato cultivar 'SOLO' was investigated for the interaction
approach with the consortium formulation K. Potatoes inoculated with formulation K,
containing consortium 96 using the same number of cells per isolate, displayed a wine-red
colour
Figure 13: Evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortia formulations against R. solani
on the potato tubers. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was evaluated in terms of infection
symptoms of the pathogen <i>R. solani</i> by using the lowest infection (1) to the highest
infection score (4)
Figure 14: Evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortia formulation against R. solani in
the greenhouse. <i>R. solani</i> was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato
cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample size was
n=6
Figure 15: Bacterial observed ASVs (A,C) and Shannon diversity (B,D)
Figure 16: Fungal observed ASVs (A,C) and Shannon diversity (B,D)
Figure 17: Bacterial (A) and fungal (B) beta diversity obtained with a Bray-Curtis distance
matrix
Figure 18: Bacterial taxonomic composition on family level
Figure 19: Differentially abundant bacterial genera that were identified between the
treatments, regardless of the presence of the pathogen
Figure 20: Fungal community composition on family level
Figure 21: <b>Oomycetal taxonomic composition on genus level.</b>
Figure 22: Oomycetal shannon diversity (A) and observed ASVs (B)
Figure 23: Oomycetal beta diversity retrieved by Bray-Curtis distance matrix

Figure 24: Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on the distinct symptoms caused by *R. solani* in the field. *R. solani* was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the efficiency of the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=4......45 Figure 25: Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on the sclerotia infestation caused by *R. solani* in the field. *R. solani* was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=4. ANOVA analysis: p-value (<0.05; Figure 26: Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on scab disease in the field. R. solani was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=4. ANOVA ana Figure 27: Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on the weight of marketable tubers in the field. R. solani was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample Figure 28: Assessment of the impact of consortia formulations on the weight of marketable tubers of different tuber categories in the field. R. solani was grown on barley beads for at least 22 days. The potato tubers of all treatments, except the control, were infected with *R. solani*. The potato cultivar 'Arkula' was used to evaluate the consortia formulations. The sample size was n=4. ANOVA analysis: p-value (<0.05; Figure 29: Experimental design for the selection of 11 potato genotypes and the evaluation of antagonistic effects of consortia formulations against R. solani in the greenhouse. R. solani was grown on barley grains for at least 22 days. In total, 11 different genotypes of potato plantlets were evaluated in the frame of the interaction approach with the consortia formulations in soil (WHC 60%). ......51 Figure 30: Evaluation of formulation efficiency with different potato genotypes against R. solani in the greenhouse. R. solani was grown on barley grains for at least 22 days. In total, 11 different genotypes of potato plantlets were evaluated in the frame of the Figure 31: List of potential 'booster' substances that were screened for improvement of the traits of the bacterial consortium 'Patricia'......53 Figure 32: Antagonistic effects of the microbial consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with different boosters against R. solani (mycelia). The five best performing substances for

boosting antifungal traits of the bacterial consortium are shown. The sample size was n=6.

Figure 33: Antagonistic effects of microbial consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with different boosters against R. solani and V. dahliae (mycelia). The five best performing substances for boosting antifungal traits of the bacterial consortium are shown. Dual Culture Assay against V. dahliae (left) and R. solani (right). The sample size was n=3. ..... 55 Figure 34: Observable effects of the microbial consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with different boosters on the fitness of tomato plants. Inocula of 20 ml with the five best performing formulations containing substances for boosting antifungal traits of the bacterial consortium were inoculated to the tomato breed 'Salattomate'. (Green boxes) Positive performing formulations. (Red boxes) Negative performing formulations. The Figure 35: Four timepoints that were analysed during the life cycle of the potato plant. The potato breed 'Desiree' was inoculated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. Sampling was performed at four different timepoints. Plants implemented as negative controls were supplemented with tap water. The sample size Figure 36: Assessment of potato plants at the flowering development stage. The plants of the potato breed 'Desiree' treated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2methyl-1-butanol were earlier flowering and less stressed compared to the plants treated with water. The sample size was n=12......58 Figure 37: Potato breed 'Desiree' between timepoint two 'Development of tuber' and timepoint three 'Flowering'. The plants of the potato breed 'Desiree' treated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol showed higher resilience to heat stress compared to the plants treated with water......58 Figure 38: Assessment of the length of shoots of potato breed 'Desiree' at different life cycle timepoints. The plants of the potato breed 'Desiree' were treated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol and water. The plants were infected with *R. solani* AG-3. (a) Shoot length at 'Development of tuber'. (b) Shoot length at 'Flowering'. The sample size was n=6. ..... 59 Figure 39: Assessment of disease symptoms in potato breed 'Desiree' at 'Ripening'. The plants of the potato breed 'Desiree' were treated with consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol and water. In parallel, the plants were exposed to the pathogen R. solani AG-3. (a) Weight of tubers in gram. (b) Percentage of the distinct disease symptoms. The sample size was n=6......60

Figure 40: Bacterial alpha diversity, depicted as observed (A, C) and Shannon (B, D)
diversity. Non-parametric Kruskal-Wallis test was performed, followed by pairwise
Wilcoxon test with p-value adjustment-method ",fdr". Sample size was n=6
Figure 41: Fungal alpha diversity depicted as observed (A, C) and shannon (B, D)
diversity. Kruskal-Wallis test was applied, followed by pairwise Wilcoxon test with "fdr" as
p-value adjustment. The sample size was n=662
Figure 42: Bacterial beta diversity obtained from a Bray-Curtis distance matrix displayed
as NMDS plot
Figure 43: Fungal community composition resulting from Bray-Curtis distance matrix (A)
and with exclusion of two outliers (B)
Figure 44: Bacterial taxonomic composition on family level
Figure 45: Fungal taxonomic composition on family level
Figure 46: Assessment of the tuber number of potato breed 'Atol' and 'Krab' after
infection with the pathogen V. dahliae ELV16. The plantlets were treated with water,
consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. (a)
Potato breed 'Atol'. (b) Potato breed 'Krab'. The sample size was n=8
Figure 47: Assessment of the length of shoots of potato breed 'Bihoro' after infection
with the pathogen V. dahliae ELV16. The plantlets were treated with water, consortium
'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. The sample size
was n=8
Figure 48: Assessment of the length of the roots of potato breed 'Rudawa' after
infection with the pathogen V. dahlia ELV16. The plantlets were treated with water,
consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. The
sample size was n=8
Figure 49: Assessment of the length of the potato shoots of breed 'Brda Stara' and
'Desiree' after infection with the pathogen R. solani AG-3. The plantlets were treated
with water, consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-
butanol. (a) Potato breed 'Brda Stara'. (b) Potato breed 'Desiree'. The sample size was
n=870
Figure 50: Assessment of the weight of the shoots of potato breed 'Pasja Pomorska'
after infection with the pathogen R. solani AG-3. The plantlets were treated with water,
consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. The
sample size was n=871
Figure 51: Assessment of the dry weight of the shoots of potato breed 'Salto' after
infection with the pathogen R. solani AG-3. The plantlets were treated with water,
consortium 'Patricia' or consortium 'Patricia' supplemented with 2-methyl-1-butanol. The
sample size was n=872



## Literaturverzeichnis

Berg, Gabriele; Cernava, Tomislav (2022): The plant microbiota signature of the Anthropocene as a challenge for microbiome research. In Microbiome 10 (1), pp. 1–12.

Berg, Gabriele; Smalla, Kornelia (2009): Plant species and soil type cooperatively shape the structure and function of microbial communities in the rhizosphere. In FEMS microbiology ecology 68 (1), pp. 1–13.

Eurostat (2017): The EU potato sector - statistics on production, prices and trade. Available online at https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/main/data/database.

Hol, W. GeraH; Boer, Wietse de; Termorshuizen, Aad J.; Meyer, Katrin M.; Schneider, Johannes H. M.; van Dam, Nicole M. et al. (2010): Reduction of rare soil microbes modifies plant–herbivore interactions. In Ecology letters 13 (3), pp. 292–301.

McCullough, Ellen; Matson, Pamela (2012): Linking knowledge with action for sustainable development: A case study of change and effectiveness. In: Seeds of Sustainability: Springer, pp. 63–82.

Mendes, Rodrigo; Kruijt, Marco; Bruijn, Irene de; Dekkers, Ester; van der Voort, Menno; Schneider, Johannes H. M. et al. (2011): Deciphering the rhizosphere microbiome for disease-suppressive bacteria. In Science 332 (6033), pp. 1097–1100.

Sawers, Ruairidh J. H.; Gutjahr, Caroline; Paszkowski, Uta (2008): Cereal mycorrhiza: an ancient symbiosis in modern agriculture. In Trends in plant science 13 (2), pp. 93–97.

Sgueo, Gianluca; Tropea, Francesco; Augere-Granier, Marie-Laure (2016): How the EU budget is spent: Common Agricultural Policy. European Parliamentary Research Service. Available online at https://epthinktank.eu/2016/07/20/how-the-eu-budget-is-spent-common-agricultural-policy/, checked on 1/23/2023.

Turner, Thomas R.; James, Euan K.; Poole, Philip S. (2013): The plant microbiome. In Genome biology 14 (6), pp. 1–10.

Vandenkoornhuyse, Philippe; Quaiser, Achim; Duhamel, Marie; Le Van, Amandine; Dufresne, Alexis (2015): The importance of the microbiome of the plant holobiont. In New Phytologist 206 (4), pp. 1196–1206.

# Abkürzungen

ANOVA	Analysis of variance
ASV	Amplicon sequence variant
°C	Degree Celsius
CFU	Colony forming unit
cm	centimeter
DCA	Dual culture assay
DNA	Deoxyribonucleic acid
fdr	False discovery rate
Fig	Figure
g	gram
На	Hectar
ITS	Internal transcribed region
Kg	Kilogram
m	Meter
min	Minute
ml	Mililiter
mm	Millimeter
NMDS	Non-metric multidimensional scaling
PCR	Polymerase-Chain-Reaction
PDVA	Petri dish VOCs assay
rRNA	Ribosomal ribonucleic acid
SCAM	Strain collection of antagonist microorganisms
sp.	Species
TCVA	Two clamp VOCs assay
VOC	Volatile organic component
WP	Work package
μg	microgram

# Projektnehmer:in

Technische Universität Graz Institut für Umweltbiotechnologie <u>https://www.tugraz.at/institute/ubt/home</u>